اللجنة التنفيذية للصندوق المتعدد الأطراف

لتوفير بروتوكول مونتريال

الاجتماع الأربعة

مونتريال، 16 - 18 تموز/يوليه 2003

تقرير نهائي عن تقييم قطاع الهالونات
موجز تنفيذي

نظرة عامة

1- يتضمن هذا التقرير تخليداً للنتائج التي توصلت إليها بعثات التقييم إلى خمسة بلدان من بلدان المادة 5 (هي جمهورية الصين الشعبية، الهند، البرازيل، فنزويلا، ومالزيا) وإلى جمع التكنولوجيا والصناعة والاقتصاد التابع لليونيب في باريس.

وهيكل هذا التقرير يصور التركيب المتنوع للمشروعات الداخلة في قطاع الهالونات.

2- أن أهم خطة قطاعية للهالونات هي خطة فردة هي الخطة المطلوبة تطبيقها في الصين، والتي اعتمدتها اللجنة التنفيذية في اجتماعها 23، وهي تتكون من إزالة منشأ لإنتاج الهالونات واستهلاكها حتى عام 2010. وفي الصين حوالي 3.3 مليارات تن تستهلك الهالونات في جميع بلدان المادة 5، وتتقلل مع التصب في ذلك القطاع. والصين هي مع كوريا الجنوبية، البلد الوحيد الذي يزال بنتج الهالونات.

3- كان يوجد في الهند بعض إنتاج للهالونات في منتصف التسعينات، غير أن استهلاكاً ظل متضخماً، كما هي الحال في بلدان المادة 5، وهي بدأت استعمال الهالونات خصوصاً في عام 1990 فقط، عندما كان مقصوداً منها إزالتها بموجب بروتوكول مونتريال. ومعظم المشروعات في الهند كانت مشروعات لإنتاج طفايات الحريق، وتستكللوها إلى حد قليل خطة قطاعية لتعويض أدنين من منتجي الهالونات كما قد توقفا عن الإنتاج في وقت سابق، وذلك في سبيل التدفق النهائى لرفقهما.

4- تلقت بضعة بلدان أخرى تمويلًا لتحويل بعض صناعي طفايات الحريق، وخلال الأعوام الأخيرة تم اعتماد العديد من المشروعات لخبز الهالونات في البنك وإدارة الهالونات (أنظر المرفق الأول)، بالإضافة إلى ذلك فإن اليونيب، في السنوات المبكرة، قام بتنفيذ سلسلة من المشروعات غير الاستعمارية.

(ب) منتجو الهالونات

5- أن إزالة إنتاج الهالونات في الصين يسير وفقاً للجدول الزمني المنقى عليه، بل بأسرع من ذلك الجدول، وهو الجدول الذي تتضمنه خطة إزالة قطاع الهالونات. (انظر المرفق الثاني)، فهل أن إزالة الهالون 1301 أمكن التحجيل بها لأن الطلبات المستوي الداخلية عليها وكذلك الصادرات كانت أقل ما كان متوقعاً في الخطة. ولم يتم التبليغ عن أي نقص في إنتاج الهالونات للأغراض الحرجة، وظل التنقل إلى عواصم بديلة للهالونات يسير بخطى تواكب المتطلبات. وجميع منتجي الهالونات الذين خفضوا أو توقفوا عن الإنتاج قد أعربوا عن ارتفاع عام إلى العملية، وعلى أساس الدلائل الموثقة، وكذلك على أساس تقارير التحقق الصادرة عن مراقبة البنك الدولي، ثم يحدث أية محاولة لإنتاج مقدار أكبر مما سمح به الحرص المخصصة أو لإعادة الإنتاج الذي سبق الكف عنه. والطلب الداخلي والدولي المنخفض على الهالونات لم يكن فيه حافز لمثل ذلك. وقد أعربت الشركات التي
تمت زيادة عدد بعض الشواغل بشأن حواصل الزبر المحذوف الناشئين عن المناقشات الشديدة وعن أصوات البيع المحذوفة لبلاط

الهالونات .

6- أن مراكز إنتاج الهالونات التي تم زيارتها في الصين قد قرر تكييفهما كلياً أو جزئياً، بما يتضمن وضع الإزالة التي تم التوقيع عليها مع وكالة SEPA. أما وحدات إنتاج الهالونات المتبقية فهي قديمة، وتتمتع على الأرجح إلى صيانة طويلة الأمد إذا كانت مستقلة عن الخطوات لدتها طويلة، غير أن هذا ليس هو الحال. وإعادة تشغيل المصنع التي توقف تشغيلها مؤقتاً أمر يستغرق وقتاً طويلاً جداً. في كل مرة، يصل إلى شهر، قبل أن يصبح من الممكن تحقيق إنتاج مستمر ذي جودة موثقة بها من جديد. وهذا ليس أبداً غير اعتبادي، عندما يتم إنتاج الهالونات بطريقة موسيعة فقط.

7- أن إنتاج الهالون 1301 في الصين يعاقب إنهاؤه في وقت أسرع مما كان متوقعاً في خطة إزالة الهالونات . وتبعاً لذلك فإن

إمكانية تحقيق هذا الإغلاق التام يجب إيجاد إليه.


9- أن مصنع الهالونات في الهند قد تم تكييفهما وتم الحصول على ذلك من جانب فريق مراجعة مستقل استشارته البنك الدولي.

وقد أتمت انشطة تقييمها البناء وقدتا تقارير منهما . وتمت مراجعة التقارير أيضاً على يد مراجع مستقل استشارته البنك .

(ج)

صانعي طفائر الحرائق

10- أن نطاق خطة إزالة قطاع الهالونات في الصين صدر 56 تعاقداً للتصدير والإغلاق مع صانعي طفائيات الحرائق وبضعة صانعي أنظمة الإطفاء. وتم تنفيذ 46 من هذه التعاقبات، ومعظمها قبل الآونة المحددة أو في الآونة المحددة، بينما حدثت بعض التأخيرات في برنامج عام 2000 و 2001 و 2002 وما يلد على التحولات الطاردة في عدد الشركات التي تقوم بالتحول. بالقياس إلى القائمة الأصلية التي تتضمن 72 صانعاً لطايمات الحرائق و 22 صانعاً لأنظمة الإطفاء، وبدل الأمر على أن الصانعين المتبقين يصعب أقناعهم بالقيام بالتحول. ونحوت جذور الكمال هو
0.45 دولار أمريكي للـ و 0.50 دولار أمريكي للـ H2111 يبلغ 100 في السنة (عوامل 3:1) مع عدم حساب استعمال الـ H1301 في الأنظمة الثانوية. ومعامل التحول الأعلى بالنسبة للـ H1301 (10:1) من شأنه أن يزيد من تحسين جودة التكاليف.

11- أن التكنولوجيات والمقاييس والموارد الجديدة قد أحدثت أبطالاً أكبر في إيجاد صناعة تصنع معدات الإطفاء. وتنوع الصانعين الموجودين، وداخل البلدان في هذا الميدان، والتحول نحو إنتاج ذات جودة ومقايير كبيرة. كانت هي السمك الرئيسية وتحرك الصناعة نحو قطاع صحي وجريد التنوع، سوف يأتي احتيادات الصين في مجال الحماية من الحرائق، بينما ينمي أيضاً أسواق التصدير.

12- كان لدى الهند 14 مشروعًا معتدلاً لتحويل صنعي شرائح الحريق وأنظمة الإطفاء، منها 13 مشروعًا نفتذه وأتمته البورشديي وهو مشروع واحد نفذ البنك الدولي وتلغى الآن في الاجتماع الـ 39 لجنة التنفيذية، على الرغم من أن التحول كان قد حدث فعلاً. ومجموع الأموال التي صرفت يبلغ حوالي 1.2 مليون دولار أمريكي. وتبلغ متوسط جودة التكاليف الفعلية هو 0.93 دولار أمريكي للـ و 0.50 دولار H1301. والمجموع الأول من المشروعات قد أثبت بتأخير عدة أشهر، ولكن معظم المشروعات في المجموعة الثانية التي وافق عليها الاجتماع الـ 28 من اجتماعات اللجنة التنفيذية قد أتمت قبل 13 شهراً من الموعد المحدد لها في الجدول الزمني.

13- أن المعدات التي توردها شرائح الحريق في الهند تجزت كثيراً قدراتها الإنتاجية. وهناك ضعف استعمال كبير يبدو في استعمال المعدات التي تم توريدها، مع ذلك، خصوصاً بالنسبة للأدوات الآلية التي تم اقتربتها رفقة، لإنتاج صمامات الضغط العالي. هذه المعدات تمثل مبلغة بدون استعمال في معظم الوقت. وقد شكت الشركات التي تميزت زياراتها من قناة الطلبات المقدمة لها. ومن الأرجح أن الطلبات قد أحرقتها الأعراس العالمية لشرائح الحريق الجديدة ABC التي بيعت. ارتفاع أسعار شرائح الحريق في الهند يجعل المشترين المحتملين ينكسرون عن الاستعاضة عن الشواذ الموجودة لديهم، بما فيها طلبات BC، والغلافية تكون غير كافية بتركيب أقل من الحد الأدنى اللازم من المعدات.

(د) مساعدة تقنية للقواطع بمعايير جديدة

14- أن وضع معايير في الوقت المناسب للألوان يمنح مبتهجات بديلة وضع مدونات بناء جديدة (building codes)، أمر هام جداً لتحقيق الانقلاب السريع والسلس لإنتاج واستعمال المواد البديلة للهالوانت. وبناءً على المعايير والموارد الدولية متاحة بسهولة فأن بلدان المادة 5 ذات الحجم الكبير مثل الصين والهند تريد أن تضع معاييرها ومداولاتها ذاتية، المخولة مع التفاهم المحلي، ومع خصائص صناعتها وأعمال البناء لديهما.

15- أن عدة أنشطة من المساعدة التقنية قد تم تطبيقاتها في الظل - خطة الإزالة قطاع الهالوانت في الصين، لتقوية المعايير الخاصة بشرائح الحريق وأنظمة الإطفاء، خصوصاً تعزيز المعايير الموجودة والمطابقة في الصين طوال بعض الوقت. ووضع المعايير
الجديدة بصفة خاصة للأنظمة الثقيلة ، التي تستخدم مثلاً HFC 227ea وركاز مائي ، لم يتم بعد . والركاز المائي ، على الرغم من أنه يحد مساحة من مبادرات مكتب مكافحة الحريق ، فإنه بطي الانطلاق ، بسبب عدم توافر المعايير الوطنية اللازمة . وفي غياب المعايير الوطنية ، فإن مكتبة مكافحة الحرائق الوطنية قد أدخلت معايير ذاتية ، القائمة على أساس المدونات الأجنبية (foreign codes ) في سبيل تصنيف وتقييم استخدام عوامل الإطفاء الجيدة . ونتيجة لذلك ، فإن تقييمما في استخدام الأومر . وبينما ما أدى ذلك إلى تخزين جودة المنتجات محلياً إلا أن التسويق على نطاق البلد كله محدود . وتوفر مستوي الموارد التقنية لمسؤولي الإطفاء من خلال برامج تدريب منظمة .


17 - إن الزيول هي مناهل على المصادر التي يمكن أن تصادف عندما يتم الأخذ بمعايير دولية دون التنقيم السليم لجميع ما يرتبط عليها من أمور . وال답ه المحلي الذي كان يشتري حداً أعلى قدر 55 في المئة من محتوى الفوسفات ، قد استغنى عنه في 1998 ببعض الابيزو ISO 12907 معيار الابيزو للحصول على الكيمياء الجاف . إنها تشتري مستوي من الأداء لجهزة الإطفاء . والأخذ ببعض الابيزو قد أدى الآن إلى انخفاض جودة مساحيق ABC الكيمياء الجاف ، وهو المادة التي تفضل كبيديال الهالون 1211 لتطابق الحرائق ABC.

(HBR&R)

(ه) خزان الهالونات في البنوك ، والاسترداد وإعادة التدوير (HBR&R).

18 - أن مشروعات HBR&R لها دور رئيسي تلعبه في الحفاظ على الراقبة الثانية للإطفاء التي تعمل بالهالونات ، وكذلك HBR&R ، إلى حد محدود ، بقاء طفاحات الحريق . وخلال الفترة الانتقالية للتكيف التي هي فترة الانتقال من الإطفاء بال HODS ، فإن القضاء على الحريق وعوامل التحكم وينتمي لتكيف الجاف ، فإن بنوك الهالونات توقع صفر بالحفاظ على الاستوارات المجففة من أمان من يشغولون الواقع وحماية المتطلبات خلال الفترة الانتقالية . ويمكن أن تمت هذه الفترة عدة سنوات . والمقدار الإجمالي التي يتم تركيبها للاستخدام والتي يحتاج إليها للحفاظ على سلامة هذه الأنظمة . سوف تتناقص تدريجياً.

19 - أن مشروعات HBR&R هي مشروعات معقدة بمعنى أن نجاحها يعتمد على كثير من أسباب المصلحة ومن العوامل HBR&R ، فإن جانب الوقائع الأساسي المائل في فورض الأسعار بين الهالونات الجديدة والهالونات المستورة /العاد تدويرها . هي فورق يجب
أن تكون كبيرة إذا حد كاف لتحمل تكلفة التشغيل (إذا لم تكن تصرف أي إعانات) فإن البكسل يعتمد أساساً على التعاون مع الصناعات المستعملة ومع الوكالات الحكومية. أن تقييمًا جيدًا لخصائص البلد واحتياجاته وخطط أمر لا زال في كل حالة تحديد حجم الوقود والمعلومات للمشروعات HBR&R. أن بناء تفاوت وطني في الارادة على استراتيجيّة ما قد لا يكون أمرًا سهلاً وسوف يستغرق وقتاً. والدروس المستفادة من تنفيذ المشروعات السابقة، كما يشير إلى ذلك التقرير، ينبغي أن تؤخذ في الحسبان عند تنفيذ المشروعات الجارية وإعداد مشروعات جديدة.

و(20) أن برامج التدريب، في سبيل أن تكون فعالة وقابلة للبقاء، ينبغي أن يتم تفصيلها على قدر احتياجات البلد الذي يتلقاها. وفيما يضمن التدريب معلومات عن تدليل العجز وتبني المصادر المحلية لقطع الغيار، وتصنيعات العدد وصيانتها. وكذلك معلومات عن الممارسات المحلية في خدمة الهالونات وتشويقها وتركيبها وإدارتها وعن القوانين الوطنية.

انظمة الهالون المخصصة بالهالونات

(21) أن البكسل قد لعب فيما مضى دورًا حيًا في قطاع الهالونات، خاصًة في خرض الهالونات حيث أن القرار 26/IV الصادرة عن الأطراف قد طلب من البكسل أن يعمل كفرقة تبادل المعلومات المتعلقة بالإدارة الدولية لبنوك الهالونات. ومساعدة البكسل لقطاع الهالونات في بلدان المادة 5 إلى اليوم، في نطاق الصندوق المتعدد الأطراف، قد تضمن ثلاثة أنواع من الأنشطة هي:

الفترة الدولية لتبادل المعلومات بشأن بنوك الهالونات، المنشورات، والرش.

(22) أن البكسل في تشاور مع HTOC، قد صمم وأنشأ بوابة وب لتكوين صلة بين الأعمال، مسجلاً موقع الويب هذا مصمم للشركات التي تستعمل الهالونات في التطبيقات "الحرة" ويوفر سوقاً نظريا يمكن أن يكون فيها العرض على قدر الطلب بالنسبة للهالونات المخصصة. وبينما يقترب البكسل حتى اليوم بتبني أدوات معاليل مؤكدة ذات شأن في البيئات المتصلة على أرب المشارك إليه، حيث أن العاملات المتعلقة بالأعمال تظل معاملات خاصة، غير أن استراتيج ثبات بياضات من جانب المنظمات (وهي في بعض الحالات أعمال نشر متعددة)، والتعليمات من المستعملين تدل على أن هذه الخدمة لها فائدة.

(23) قام البكسل أيضاً بإنتاج وتوزيع مستشرفات وورقة إعلامية، يتعلّق بقطاع الهالونات، وبعض مسؤولي الأوزون وممثلين الوسط الماليين للكندا الدولي الذين تمت لقاءات معهم. وكانت لهم أنشطة على مدى سنوات في برامج إزالة الهالونات في بلدان المادة 5. كانوا يذكرون نشرات البكسل. كما كان من يعمل في هذا المجال من فترة وجيزة فقط على غير بيئة محددة بتلك النشرات. كما تزداد التوجهية التقنية أو العاملة المتاحة من البكسل، فيهم كانوا لا يكونون أوروبا محددة أو تفاесть معينة وقروا بأنهم لا يستغلوا إلا استعمالًا عابراً تلك المصادر. والعلومات التقنية المقدمة تطرف أصلاً نهجًا عالمياً، غير أن الحاجة الآن هي إلى ورشات إعلامية تقنية موجزة ومحترمة تتعلق بالياء مهمًا بالوضع الذي يركز عليه الاهتمام.
تنبيهي لليونيب أن يكمل من خلال الدعاية وبرنامج التوعية إلا تقوم بلدان المادة 5 التي لديها خزائن من الهالونات بتضحيتها وسائر الأمان الخاصة ببعضها من الناحية الاستراتيجية والتكتيكية . والمعلومات الخاصة بإدارة الهالونات ينبغي أن توفر الإرشاد لبلدان المادة 5 كي تعمل على تحديد احتياجات القطاع الحربي والقطاع الاستراتيجي .

 Gorgeous

**وصولات**

- **أ** على أساس النتائج التي توصلت إليها عملية التقييم فمن الوصفي به ما يلي :

- تقوم الصين والهند بتعجيل إتمام المعارف والمعلومات لبداية الهالونات ، في تعاون مع البنك الدولي في الصين مع اليونيدب في الهند .

- تقوم الصين بدراسة موقف كاملة وحايدة لبداية الهالونات في الوقت الحاضر والتوقع عليها في المستقبل ، باستعمال الخبرة الوطنية والدولية . وينبيهي أن يساعد ذلك على تخطيط الاستثمار بالعالي العلاج ، فعلاً بدلاً من الاستثمار في مشروعات ساحقة صغيرة ، عندما تكون السنة الإجمالية قربة من 100,000 طم ABC من المنتجات في مشروعات منافسة مثل HFC227ea و HFC236fa في السنة ، فالشركاء التي تقوم بالاستثمار في بدايات مثل HSPP و بكال الغرير في نطاق أعمال واضحة وموضوع بها ، ينبيهي أن يكون قانوناً على أشار خطط أعمال واضحة وموضوع بها ، في سبيل كفالة البقاء في سوق تغليف الفعال في بسرعة ، مع تفادي أي تشكيلات للتنافس . والتحولات التي تتحلى بالتحول أو إحلال المشروعات يمكن كذلك الحفاظ عليها لتعزيز التكاليف اللازمة لحذف الهالونات في البنك والتسهيلها.

- **ج** مطلوب من الصين أن تعيد النظر في الادوات والانجح المتعلقين بنك الهالونات المزعج في ولاية Guangdong ، بقصد إدراج مناطق للمستقبل يمكن أن توصل إلى البقاء والدوام.

- **د** مطلوب من الهند والإمبراطورية وألمانيا ، في تعاون مع الوكالة المنظمة العالمية أن تستعرض الوضع المؤسس القائم وإطار السياسة العامة لحذف الهالونات في البنك لديهما ، ومعلومات الاستثمار وإعداد التدوير التي يجري تنفيذها . بقصد تعزيز بفتها وتعزيزها للصعيد الوطني كله.

- **ه** ينبغي أن تقوم الأمانة بتقييم أشتر لينونك الهالونات ، شاملة بنك الهالونات الصغيرة والكبيرة والإقليمية ، بقصد تقييم استمرارتها .

- **و** مطلوب من اليونيب إعداد ونوات إعلامية تقنية موجزة ، خاصة ببعض الموضوعات على وجه التحديد ، يستعملها مسؤولو الأوزون . وينبيهي للمعلومات بشأن إدارة شؤون الهالونات ، بمساندة من مسؤول برناج
المساعدة على الامتثال للهالونات الذي سيجري تعيينه ، أن يوفر إرشاداً محدداً لاختلاف البلدان العاملة في نطاق المادة 5 ، كي تبين الاحتياجات الخاصة بالقطاع الحرج والقطاع الاستراتيجي .
I. Introduction

25. This report gives an overview of the evaluation approach and provides a synthesis of the main findings and recommendations of the evaluation consultants, who visited 3 countries in Asia (PR China, India, Malaysia) and two in Latin America (Brazil, Venezuela). (For details about the sample of projects visited see Section IV below).

26. The country evaluation reports (CER) and project evaluation reports (PER) are available on request, and will also be placed on the Secretariat’s web site, in the section "Executive Committee", evaluation reports. The Executive Summary of the China Country Evaluation Report is presented in Annex V, in order to enable readers to get a more comprehensive view of the largest programme in the halon sector funded by the MLF.

II. Evaluation Process

27. The evaluation proceeded with the following steps:

(a) In-depth desk review by a consultant studying the documentation, identifying evaluation issues and proposing projects for field visits;

(b) preparation of a summary by the Senior Monitoring and Evaluation Officer and presentation to the Monitoring, Evaluation and Finance Sub-committee at the 37th Meeting of the Executive Committee (Document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/37/6), which took note of the proposed evaluation approach;

(c) preparation by the consultants of draft evaluation reports on each project and country reports on each country visited; the country reports analyze the halon sectors of the countries in terms of past achievements and remaining tasks for ODS phase out;

(d) Sending draft country evaluation reports (CER) and draft project evaluation reports (PER) to the countries and Implementing Agencies concerned for comments.

(e) Integrate the comments received into the final versions and prepare the draft synthesis report by the Senior Monitoring and Evaluation Officer.

(f) Sending the draft synthesis report to the Implementing Agencies concerned for comments, and integrating comments received into the present final synthesis report.

III. Evaluation Team, Support by the Ozone Offices and Implementing Agencies

28. The lead consultant was the former Deputy Fire Chief of Malaysia and former member of the Halon Technical Options Committee (HTOC). He participated in all visits. In China, two more consultants focused on the production sector and institutional issues of the halon sector plan. The Senior Monitoring and Evaluation Officer coordinated the evaluation missions in PR China, India and Brazil, and the Senior Programme Management Officer responsible for halon projects in the Fund Secretariat participated in PR China and Venezuela as resource person.
29. The governments of all countries visited had been informed beforehand, and their concurrence had been obtained. The evaluation missions were very well received and supported by the Ozone Offices in the countries visited. The Ozone Officers prepared the visits to the companies and accompanied the evaluation team. Information requested on companies and national policies, including experiences gained during project implementation, were readily provided. Representatives of the companies were cooperative and accessible.

30. The World Bank specialist dealing with halon sector projects joined the evaluation mission in China, and staff of the World Bank's financial intermediary in China met the mission and accompanied them on all company visits. A UNDP Project Officer accompanied the mission during some project visits in India. Discussions were held with UNEP/DTIE as well as with Environment Canada and their halon consultant before and after the field visits to Brazil and Venezuela. Germany’s GTZ provided an analysis of experiences gained so far with the implementation of regional halon banking projects.

IV. Sample of Projects Visited

31. In China, 5 of former 14 halon producers were visited, as well as 4 fire equipment and systems manufacturers, and six producers of halon substitutes. In India, one of two halon producers and 7 fire equipment and systems manufacturers were included in the sample.

32. Halon banking and recovery and recycling centers were visited in all five countries visited. In contrast to the planning (see para. 37 of the desk study, document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/376), it was not possible to include similar projects in low-volume consuming countries in the sample, due to lack of time. The particular features of regional halon banks could thus only briefly be analyzed based on available documentation, but are not included in this report. They would merit an evaluation, jointly with other halon bank management projects, once they are more advanced in their implementation.

33. In all countries visited, the development of standards and codes for substitute products as well as policies to enforce and monitor their introduction was discussed with fire fighting authorities, research and testing institutes, and industry associations.

34. The sample selected covered the main types of projects (halon producer, fire extinguisher and systems manufacturer, R&R and halon banking), which were implemented in various years and by several implementing agencies. China received the largest amount of funding for the halon sector plan (so far US $46.8 million in six annual tranches of US $62 million approved in principle), followed by a sector plan for India (US $2.6 million). 16 of the 23 fire extinguisher projects approved are in China and India. China and India are also implementing halon banking and recovery and recycling projects, as do Brazil, Venezuela and Malaysia, and a number of other countries (see the Overview of Projects and Funds Approved for Halon Phase-out in Annex I).

35. In view of the above, the sample is seen as sufficiently representative to allow for formulating conclusions and lessons learnt for this sector, which has almost finalized the conversion in the manufacturing industry. On-going projects are mostly halon banking and management projects, as mentioned above.
V. **Evaluation Issues and Data Collection Approach**

36. Detailed evaluation issues and terms of reference for the evaluation were presented to the 37th Meeting of the Executive Committee (Document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/37/6, paragraph 38). For the China Halon Sector Phase-out Plan, specific evaluation issues were formulated before the mission to address the particular features of the sectoral approach.

37. Data were collected mainly in semi-structured interviews with beneficiary companies, Ozone Units, fire authorities and other stakeholders. The information obtained was then compared with the documentation (project documents, Secretariat’s comments, PCRs, annual work programmes for sector plans and verification reports). After the visits, project evaluation reports (PER) were prepared for individual projects and interview notes for activities under sector plans and non-investment projects as well as general discussions.

38. UNEP/DTIE provided data and material as well as their views with regard to the halon related activities completed and under implementation.

VI. **Halon Production**

(a) **PR China**

39. China and India are the only Article 5 countries with facilities for producing halons 1211 and 1301. For China, the phase-out of both halon production and consumption was agreed upon in a sector plan which was approved by the 23rd meeting of the Executive Committee with total funding of US $62 million. Under the sector plan, total phase-out of consumption and production of halon 1211 will be realized in 2006, and of halon 1301 in 2010. So far, six annual funding tranches amounting to US $ 46.8 million have been approved by the Executive Committee for the implementation of the work programmes from 1998 to 2003.

40. In 1997, there were 14 H1211 producers with a total production of 11,664 metric metric tonnes, and one H1301 producer with a production of 618 metric tonnes. In 2002, H1211 production was down to 2,469.4 metric tonnes, representing a phase-out of 9,174.6 metric tonnes (27,523.8 ODP metric tonnes), and production was limited to two producers. In 2002, H1301 production was zero metric tonnes. There was no production because stocks were adequate. Demand could be quantified as 176.70 metric tonnes, which was served from existing stocks (see Annex II).

41. The reduction in the production of halons is occurring according to plan and even ahead of the agreed schedule. Apparently, the phase-out of halon 1301 could be accelerated because annual domestic demand and exports are well below the annual capability to produce H1301. In other words, the time will come soon when one sustained production run will meet actual and anticipated remaining needs for H1301, following which the plant could be closed down ahead of schedule.

42. Funds allocated to the reduction of halon production totalled US$ 13,602,733 from 1998 to 2002, making it the largest area of funding under the HSPP.
Table 1: Overview of Funding and Phase-out in Halon Producer Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Phase-out (mt)</th>
<th>Funds (US$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>3,068.4</td>
<td>4,605,880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>1,942.0</td>
<td>2,900,374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1,990.0</td>
<td>3,149,553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>730.0</td>
<td>1,392,926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>798.0</td>
<td>1,554,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8,528.4</td>
<td>13,602,733</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Based on data from SEPA

43. No shortages of halons for critical users were reported and the availability of alternatives has kept pace with requirements. All phased-down and discontinued producers have expressed general satisfaction with the process and, based on visual evidence as well as on the verification reports of the auditors engaged by the World Bank, there has been no attempt to produce beyond quotas allotted or to restart stopped production. Some concerns were expressed by former halon producers about low profit margins due to lower selling prices and more competition for alternatives, in particular ABC powder.

44. The two projects funded for producing ABC powder (one before and one as part of the sector plan) have generated 4-6% of the total estimated present production capacity for ABC powder in China. Capacity utilization in these two projects was in 2002 about 35%. ABC powder Beijing is focusing on other products, in particular fire trucks, while Foshan is planning to increase the production capacity to 10,000 mt per year, hoping to realize thereby considerable economies of scale to become more competitive.

45. Halon production facilities visited in China have been totally or partially dismantled, in line with the phase-out contracts signed with SEPA. Remaining halon production units are old and would probably require some extended maintenance if they had a long-term future, but this is not the case. The start-up of temporarily idled plants takes every time a considerable period, up to a month, before continuous production of reliable quality is possible again. This is not unusual when halons are produced in campaigns only.

(b) India

46. For India, the Executive Committee approved at its 34th meeting a sectoral phase-out plan for US $2.6 million to close down production capacities for halon 1211 and 1301 as well as to convert 5 remaining fire extinguisher companies.

47. The two Indian halon producers SRF and Navin Fluorine (NFI) established their facilities in 1990/1992 (NFI) and 1994/1995 (SRF). Nominal capacities were 500 mt at SRF and 300 mt at NFI. Production reached a maximum level of 95 mt in 1995 at NFI and 109 mt in 1998 at SRF, consisting almost entirely of H 1211 as H 1301 was not produced in commercial quantities although its production was technically feasible.
48. The low capacity utilization and early stop of production (NFI in 1996 and SRF in 1998) was due to changes of market demand and supply compared to the original planning. Demand in India decreased faster than expected due to awareness raising activities and conversion projects and the ready availability of substitutes, most of them expensive, however. Remaining demand for halon is covered by low cost imports from China, and, in perspective, from recovered and recycled halons from phased-out installations in the country, once the halon banking project will become operational.

49. At the mission’s visit to SRF in September 2002, the company declared its readiness to proceed rapidly with the destruction of the critical components of its halon production facility which had been mothballed under nitrogen cover since 1999. However, delays occurred for three main reasons: firstly, it took nine months to reach an agreement with the other halon producer about how to divide the funds approved by the 34th meeting of the Executive Committee which were considerably reduced in comparison to the project proposal; secondly, the consultant company hired by the World Bank raised a number of concerns, mainly with regard to ecological issues related to the dismantlement plan presented by the company; and thirdly, the Grant Agreement between India and the World Bank needed an amendment.

50. The Grant agreement amendment has recently been signed by the Financial Intermediary (FI) and the Bank. FI is in the process of signing the Sub-Grant agreements with the 2 beneficiary enterprises. This process is expected to be completed very soon, after which the disbursements can be made. The two halon plants have been dismantled and verification done by an independent audit team hired by the Bank. Both enterprises have completed their environmental assessments and have submitted the reports. These were also reviewed by an independent auditor hired by the Bank.

VII. Fire Extinguisher and Systems Manufacturers

(a) Main Features of Enterprises

51. Fire extinguisher and systems manufacturers in large Article 5 countries are composed of the following types of activities:

   (a) Manufacture of different fire extinguishers varying in terms of size and extinguishing agent used. These manufacturing establishments also generally carry out ancillary works associated with manufacturing like coating operations, painting, etc. Most of the establishments have quality control procedures, testing laboratories (analytical) and testing facilities (mechanical, electrical and electronic).

   (b) Fixed installations. These companies may also manufacture extinguishers as separate operation. Systems are using CO₂, HFC 227, Foam, Low Pressure CO₂, Inergen, etc. Some of the system manufacturers are also involved in systems design and installation.

   (c) Valves and components, in particular outer shells for portable fire extinguishers and fixed installations.
(d) Valves and components for larger, normally water-based systems (automatic sprinklers, deluge systems, mulsifier systems, and water mist installations). It is possible that sprinkler head and water mist head production will become a sub-group because of large volumes involved.

(e) Alarm, electronic and electrical systems. This sector is usually a sub-sector that also involves security alarms, smoke detectors and heat sensors and other monitoring and control devices.

52. Larger cylinders used for fixed installations, chemicals (Dry Powder, Foam, HFC, CO₂, N₂, Aqueous Film Forming Foam (AFFF), etc.), electronic/electrical control and actuation device panels, and specialised fittings (stainless steel fittings, water mist heads, etc.) are supplied by specialist manufacturers or they are imported. In smaller countries, specialized parts are usually imported, especially those designed to be used with high pressure.

(b) PR China

53. Table 2 below gives an overview of funding provided to Halon fire extinguisher and system manufacturers under the Halon Sector Phase-out Plan (HSPP) in China. Contracts have been awarded to eligible enterprises for the conversion and/or closure of 56 enterprises. Under the Halon Sector Phase-out Plan in China, a total number of 56 conversion and closure contracts have been concluded with fire extinguisher and a few system manufacturers. 46 of them have been executed, most of them ahead of time or on schedule, while some delays occurred in the 2000 programme. The volume of phase-out contracted and funding allocated has significantly decreased in 2001 and 2002, reflecting that there are less and less companies to convert from the original list of 72 fire extinguisher manufacturers and 22 systems manufacturers, and that the remaining manufacturers are more difficult to motivate to proceed with the conversion. The average cost-effectiveness is US$ 0.45 per kg of ODP phased-out, much below the threshold of US$ 1.48 per kg, assuming that only H1211 with a conversion factor of 1:3 is phased out, thereby neglecting H1301 with a higher conversion factor (1:10). Including it would show an even better cost-effectiveness.

Table 2: Halon Fire Extinguishers and System Manufacturers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Phase-out (MT)</th>
<th>Funds (US$)</th>
<th>Cost-Effectiveness (US$/kg of ODP)*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>2,616.7</td>
<td>3,609,337</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>1,301.1</td>
<td>1,423,888</td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1,138.4</td>
<td>1,711,629</td>
<td>0.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>221.8</td>
<td>385,310</td>
<td>0.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>187.8</td>
<td>301,942</td>
<td>0.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5,465.8</td>
<td>7,432,106</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Assuming an ODP conversion factor of 1:3 by taking into account H1211 only and not H1301 which has a conversion factor of 1:10.

Source: Based on data from SEPA
54. The absence of National Standards for many of these systems prompted the sourcing of foreign standards and codes and technologies on local and provincial level which had very positive effects on quality of products but hampered country-wide marketing. On the other hand, Chinese manufacturers started to be contacted by foreign traders as a valuable source of inexpensive, good quality fire extinguishers and systems. This is a reversal of the initial approach when China was thought to be a potential market. The new pattern is in its early stages and is still consolidating but has been one of the greatest effects of the phase-out on Chinese Fire Equipment Manufacturers.

55. The level of investments, development of new products, and innovations in using different agents as additives to improve extinguishing properties and their potency are very encouraging. It is almost certain that 95% of the previous halon applications would be replaced by alternatives, except for a small sensitive sector, mainly military hardware including aircrafts, the civil aviation and parts of oil industry installations.

56. The new technologies, standards and extinguishing agents have brought a restructuring of the fire equipment manufacturing industry. The diversification of existing manufacturers, new entrants, and a move towards quality and mass production have been the main features. The industry is moving towards a healthy well-diversified manufacturing sector that will meet the fire protection needs in China, while developing also export markets.

(c) India

57. India had 14 projects approved for the conversion of fire extinguisher and system manufacturers, 13 of them implemented and completed by UNDP and one by the World Bank which was cancelled at the 39th Meeting of the Executive Committee although the conversion had taken place (see table 3 below).

58. Total funds disbursed are US $1,216,025; funds approved for the 13 implemented project were US $1,371,380, the average actual cost effectiveness is US $0.93. The first batch of projects was completed with several months of delays but most projects of the second group approved by the 28th meeting of the Executive Committee were completed 13 months ahead of schedule.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Projects</th>
<th>Total Funds Approved (US$)</th>
<th>Funds Disbursed (US$)</th>
<th>ODP To Be Phased Out (ODP Metric tonnes)</th>
<th>ODP Phased Out (ODP Metric tonnes)</th>
<th>Approved Average Cost-Effectiveness (US$/kg)</th>
<th>Actual Average Cost-Effectiveness (US$/kg)</th>
<th>Average Delays (Months)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Completed</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>1,371,390</td>
<td>1,216,075</td>
<td>1,306</td>
<td>1,307</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cancelled</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>251,736</td>
<td></td>
<td>462</td>
<td>462</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1,623,126</td>
<td>1,216,075</td>
<td>1,768</td>
<td>1,769</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Inventory
59. Equipment supplied to fire extinguisher manufacturers in India has considerably enhanced their production capacities. There is an apparent gross under-utilization of equipment supplied, however, particularly of the numerically controlled machine tools for the production of high pressure valves, being under wraps most of the time. Companies visited complained about lack of orders. It is probable that demand has been hampered by the high prices of the new ABC fire extinguishers sold. The high cost of fire extinguishers in India deters potential buyers to replace existing extinguishers including BC extinguishers. Inadequate coverage by installing less than the required minimum number of extinguishers is the result.

60. Rapid conversion of halon fire extinguishers manufacturing is also hampered by inadequate support from laws and regulations for the use of alternative technologies and agents (see also section VIII b below). CO₂ fire extinguishers have been identified very early as a possible substitute for Halon 1211 fire extinguishers. The valves and design used in the manufacturing of CO₂ fire extinguishers were so antiquated, however, that it was not only a deterrent to those who wanted to change over from Halon 1211 but also cumbersome for the users which limited the effectiveness.

61. The funding for the required technology for the modernized squeeze grip valve for CO₂ high pressure cylinders, should have helped to quicken the phase-out of Halon 1211. Though every fire extinguisher manufacturer seems to have acquired the blue prints for the valves and established manufacturing capabilities at considerable project cost by installing modern numerical machine tools, they are unable to proceed due to missing regulations. The required amendments and development of standards are said to be still in drafting stages. The relevant authorities are not able to test and approve high pressure valves in the absence of these standards, delaying the conversion to high pressure CO₂ fire extinguishers.

62. The change over from Halon 1301 to alternative agents for fixed installations is hindered by high cost of FM 200 which is subject to 67% duty. It costs Rs1800 per kg whereas Halon 1301 from China is marketed at Rs600 per kg. In addition, permissions to continue servicing halon systems are easy to obtain.

63. Capability and competency to service and maintain installed fixed systems using non-ODS technology is very good. Quality of equipment is guaranteed by the suppliers from overseas. However, non-ODS agents are sometimes found to be mixed with other substances. Therefore, according to consultants and engineers representing client companies, fire authorities should identify facilities and outline procedures for verifying the quality of non-ODS agents used in fixed installed systems.

64. Halon refilling equipment that has been retained for use in on-going servicing and refilling of Halon 1301 needs to be monitored. Its application should be limited to those installations that have been referred to and approved by the Ozone Cell and fire authorities.
VIII. Development and Revision of National Standards and Codes of Practice

65. The development of standards for non-ODS fire extinguishers and systems and related building codes for their installation and use are an essential element to facilitate the conversion process. In the absence of such standards and codes, manufacturers are not sure whether their new products will be accepted by fire authorities and insurance companies. This may block the necessary investments and efforts for converting manufacturing equipment and products. The choice is between adopting international standards or adapting them to local conditions or developing new ones.

66. UNEP published a handbook on “Standards and Codes of Practice to Eliminate Dependency on Halons: Handbook of Good Practices in the Halon Sector” (www.uneptie.org/ozonaction/library/policy/main.html#halstand). The handbook is designed for National Ozone Units, governments and fire protection communities. It identifies the types of standards and codes of practice that are relevant to the Protocol and provides step-by-step guidance on how to establish new, or revise existing, standards and codes of practice to promote the halon phase out.

(a) China

67. Already in June 1993, the 10th meeting of the Executive Committee approved two projects to be implemented by UNDP with the Tianjin Fire Research Institute for the revision of national fire codes and standards. These projects with a total funding of US $555,875 were completed with two resp. three years delay in September 98 and June 99, resulting in 4 revised national codes and extended training programmes. Moreover, several Technical Assistance activities were funded under the halon sector phase-out plan to revise standards for fire extinguishers and systems using CO2 as agent, essentially for enhancing existing standards that have been applied in China for some time.

68. Nevertheless, the development of new standards for substitutes such as HFC 227 and water mist is not yet completed. Too much effort has been expended in investigating details of components and equipment necessary for testing, grading and classification, while basic standards are still pending. Water mist, although supported by initiatives of the FFB, is slow to expand for lack of National Standards. The programme has been repeatedly deferred. The contract was supposed to be signed in the second quarter of 2001 and was to take 12 – 24 months to draft.

69. The splitting up of contracts for drafting standards for CO2 (8) and HFC 227 (3) between various institutes seems to be repeated for gaseous fire fighting systems, aerosol fire extinguishing agents, Inert Gas and other applications. This has caused considerable delay in the introduction of the Codes and Standards creating a setback for a more aggressive introduction of the non-ODS-substitutes.
70. The lack of National Standards delayed the introduction of non-ODS-substitutes in particular for fixed systems. In the absence of National Standards the provincial FFB have introduced their own, based on foreign codes, to classify and restrict the use of new extinguishing agents. The introduction of provincial standards, that differed from province to province, made it difficult for consultants and manufacturers of fire installations to sell nationwide. The FFB would like greater in-depth study and more detailed feedback on the new alternative agents as there is no proven track record for these products. The FFB’s concern is public safety. In the absence of convincing proof, the FFB adopt a cautionary approach.

71. The Fire Fighting Bureaus (FFB) visited explained that the pressure and demand for suitable non-ODS systems was high due to rapid urban growth and construction of many new high-rise buildings in China. The Mission did not have an opportunity to examine in depth the effect of urban growth on fire fighting capability. From observation it appears that fire fighters are coping adequately. The building by-laws for high-rise buildings and basements have been amended to address the problem of safety and property protection. Technical skills of fire officers were up-graded through organized training programmes.

72. Most of the funds spent on standards, codes and research seem to be more an exercise of institution building than a prioritized effort to expediting the halon phase-out in China. Even though the training, publicity, and enforcement measures for restricting use of halons and promoting use of alternatives have been effective, the results could have been better if National Standards and Codes had been introduced earlier.

(b) India

73. An early project approved at the 13th meeting of the Executive Committee and implemented by UNDP and the Defense Institute of Fire Research in New Delhi (Project No. IND/HAL/13/DEM/28) had the task to demonstrate and evaluate alternative fire extinguisher technologies, and to develop a sectoral strategy for halon phase-out. The fire testing laboratory was established, the tests and a series of demonstration workshops conducted and the strategy presented to the 28th meeting of the Executive Committee in July 1999. The project was completed in December 1999.

74. Another project (IND/HAL/29/TAS/243), also implemented by UNDP, was approved to revise national fire codes and related fire equipment standards. The activities which were planned to be completed by December 2002 were delayed, due to slow cooperation from the Indian Bureau of Standards. Changes and amendments to the National Building Codes have been proposed for consideration and approval by the relevant authorities. Details were not made available. About 30 standards and codes of practice were reviewed, of these 12 would be revised. Eight of these standards are said to have been sent out for public comments and should come up for adoption soon. No details were provided, but indications are that they should come into force by mid 2003. Project completion is now foreseen for August 2003.
75. Indian standards for CO₂ fire extinguishers are said to be in the final stages of development. Problems mentioned by manufacturers of CO₂ extinguishers in obtaining approvals from the relevant authorities for high-pressure cylinders and fittings should be overcome, if the new Indian Standards proposed are introduced rapidly. This needs to be monitored and verified.

76. Currently many contractors design fire protection systems for water mist and FM200 systems based on design criteria and parameters provided by their manufacturers. Many consultants and contractors have acquired the technical know-how to design and install these systems but are subject to high license fees imposed by the manufacturers. This inflates the cost of alternative systems currently being installed.

77. Nevertheless, many new industries and major companies have opted for new alternative technologies; for example, the Reliance Refinery opted for FM 200. Private wireless and telephone companies are very sensitive to preventive and damage control measures and have adopted non-ODS systems for fire protection. Many have expressed concern and anxiety on the need for verification of the authenticity of the products used in these installations. It may be necessary to establish procedures for quality control of products being introduced as alternatives to halon.

(c) Venezuela

78. Under the new constitution adopted in 2000, a new standards organization, SENCAMER, was created to monitor consumer safety and labelling. However, the standards used for fire protection are essentially those of ISO. Industry representatives indicated that the standards were minimal standards, but that the standards for the petroleum industry, airline and other essential users were often based on those required by the United States. Insurance companies did not apply different standards but are almost totally dependent on standards of insurance companies from the USA and Europe.

79. There is some controversy over the standards for ABC dry chemical powder fire extinguishers. The earlier standard requested a minimum of 55% of phosphate content. The standard was replaced in 1998 by the ISO standard, which does not prescribe the chemical content of the dry chemical powder but stipulates a performance rating for the extinguishers. The adoption of the ISO standard has now resulted in low quality ABC powders with 15% phosphate content being imported from China. Caking of this powder in the cylinders seems to be a common phenomenon. This eroded the confidence in the ABC dry chemical powder fire extinguishers, the usually preferred replacement for halon 1211 fire extinguishers.
IX. Halon Banking, Recovery and Recycling (HBR&R)

(a) Need for Country Specific HBR&R Projects and Training Programmes

80. Halon Banking, Recovery and Recycling (HBR&R) projects have a key role to play in sustaining existing fixed halon fire installations and to a limited extent portable fire extinguishers. During the transitional period of adjustment from ODS to non-ODS fire fighting, fire suppression and fire control agents and technologies, halon banks are expected to provide the buffer needed. The HBR&R will allow for maintaining critical levels of occupants safety and property protection during the transition. This period could extend for many years. Total quantity installed in use and needed to sustain these systems would gradually diminish.

81. The complete phase-out will depend on the sustainability, availability and adoption of the new non-ODS agents, new technologies and replacement cost. Some of the industries and sectors, for example the civil and military aviation industry, will take a very long time to opt for alternative agents and technologies unless there is a concerted effort by the regulating authorities and governments to force the pace. Most of the airlines in developed countries maintain a ‘young’ fleet of between 5 to 7 years. The ‘aging’ fleets are often taken over and operated by the developing nations who stretch their life to 20 or more years. Even if the aircraft manufacturers opt for new technologies and would phase-out halons which is not the case so far, the developing countries will have to service these aircrafts and their halon systems for the next 20 years to retain their airworthiness certificate if they would not proceed to very costly retrofitting.

82. The military sector in non Article 5 countries has been among the most innovative in developing alternative systems for explosion suppression and fire extinguishment for both the new machines being developed and retrofitting the existing hardware. However, most of the existing military hardware in the developing countries was purchased with halon systems and will probably continue to serve for about twenty years. The halon systems in the equipment will have to be maintained. Retrofitting would be too expensive for most of the countries.

83. For the programme to be effective and sustainable, the training has to be tailored to the needs of the recipient country operating the halon bank. Technical training provided for example in Germany, U.S.A or Australia is not sufficient as the halon bank operation and management in these countries is very different from the realities of developing countries The training should include troubleshooting, identification of local sources for spares, repairs and maintenance of the equipment supplied as well as local practices in halon servicing, marketing, installation, management and national laws. There should be guidance how to identify critical uses for which demand for halons will likely continue for some time, how to develop a country specific phase-out programme and how to design an HBR&R project to meet the strategic needs.
(b) **MLF Projects and Guidelines for HBR&R**

84. The MLF has very early on recognized the importance of recovery and recycling of halons. Particularly bilateral agencies, partly in cooperation with UNDP, initiated and implemented from 1992 onwards a series of R&R projects in several countries, which later on were combined with halon management and halon projects. So far, US $12.7 million have been approved for projects in 26 countries (see overview in Section 5 of the Report on the Desk Study on Halon Projects, document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/37/6, and up-dated statistics in Annex I of the present report).

85. The 18th Meeting of the Executive Committee approved on an interim basis guidelines for the type of equipment and volume of funding eligible for high, medium and low-level consuming countries (Decision 18/22, para. 51):

(i) countries with high-level installed capacities exceeding 250 MT of Halon 1301 and 1,000 MT of Halon 1211 should qualify for reclamation facilities for Halon 1301 and Halon 1211, respectively;

(ii) countries with a medium level of installed capacity\{XE "capacity"\} (250 MT of Halon\{XE "Halon"\} 1301 and 1,000 MT of Halon 1211) should be supported\{XE "classified"\} for servicing\{XE "servicing"\} requirements with Halon 1211 and Halon 1301 recycling\{XE "recycling"\} and recovery\{XE "recovery"\} machines;

(iii) countries with a low level of installed capacity\{XE "capacity"\} should qualify for a one time funding of US $25,000.

86. Pre-condition for approvals is that regulations\{XE "regulations"\} facilitating production\{XE "production"\} and import bans\{XE "bans"\} should be established within six months after the reclamation\{XE "reclamation"\} centre is set up. It was further stipulated that the costs for providing capital equipment\{XE "equipment"\} and management would\{XE "management"\} range from US $250,000 to US $500,000\{XE "US $500,000"\}. Funds for Halon\{XE "Halon"\} 1211/Halon 1301 reclamation\{XE "reclamation"\} centres could, if appropriate, be provided on a concessional\{XE "concessional"\} basis containing a 25 per cent grant component. In order to facilitate a final decision\{XE "decision"\} by the Executive Committee on halon\{XE "halon"\}-banking\{XE "banking"\} guidelines\{XE "guidelines"\}, the Secretariat and the Implementing Agencies should closely monitor\{XE "monitor"\} these projects as a basis for assessing the interim\{XE "interim"\} guidelines in terms of their commercial\{XE "commercial"\} viability and their financial impact on the Fund, and for assessing the possibility of establishing a regional\{XE "regional"\} halon-banking programme, including the possibility of a concessional\{XE "concessional"\} loan\{XE "concessional loan"\}\{XE "loan"\} component.

(c) **Lessons Learnt in Implementing HBR&R Projects**

87. The country case studies which are summarized in Annex III showed that HBR&R projects are complex in the sense that their success depends on many stakeholders and factors. The main positive effect of HBR&R projects in Brazil and Venezuela was that it helped to convince users, that halon phase-out and stop of imports is inevitable and acceptable, because recycled halons would still
be available during a long transition period for essential uses and the servicing of installed capacities, particularly fixed installations.

88. The following lessons learnt in the case studies should be taken into account in implementing on-going HBR&R projects and preparing new ones:

(a) Government agencies may be able to legislate and regulate the operations but often lack the necessary marketing skills and mechanisms necessary to successfully operate and sustain HBR&R facilities.

(b) A private company operating the project has to have the facilities, logistics, knowledge, background, contacts with clients and technical expertise to successfully operate and maintain the facilities. There must also be support from the industry (related associations, fire protection industry and fire equipment manufacturers). Though the operator may be viewed as a competitor, the terms and conditions must be made conducive to bring about the cooperation.

(c) The operator may find it difficult or uneconomical to operate the HBR&R facility as an independent operation, in particular, if virgin halons at low prices are still available, as in China. To be economically viable it should form part of other fire protection or service operations, as in Venezuela and Brazil. This situation will make it also difficult to find contractors interested to take a loan, even a concessional one, for the equipment.

(d) The operator must have sufficient incentives through the pricing mechanism like buy-back schemes, trade-off etc. The pricing should be conducive for the clients to want to use the facilities (in Brazil the main airline finds it cheaper and quicker to use services in Miami, U.S.A. than in Sao Paulo).

(e) Given the limited size of demand, even in relatively large countries like Brazil and Venezuela, one reclamation facility is more than enough to satisfy the demand. This implies that the government must play an active role in installing control mechanisms, jointly with the main users of recycled halons, so that a monopoly situation would not be abused and taken advantage of by the operator. Also imports of recycled halons should be allowed to maintain competition and keep prices at reasonable levels.

(f) The intended regionalization of the halon banking projects in Brazil and Venezuela did not take place and was not seriously pursued mainly because of trade restrictions, halons being considered as hazardous waste, in spite of the provisions of the Basle Convention allowing to trade recovered halons under certain conditions. While other regional halon banking projects were not analyzed, for lack of time and because they are in their early stages of implementation, they should take into account the difficulties encountered by Venezuela and Brazil and should be evaluated once their implementation has further advanced.
Halon bank operators must keep proper records of quantities received, recycled, stored or sold. Spot checks must be made to verify the authenticity of the records and operations. Some clients in Brazil and Malaysia have alleged manipulation of figures and unfair practices. A small commission may be charged by the responsible government agency per kg of halon recycled, as it is practiced by FONDOIN in Venezuela. This will foster sustained agency interest and supervision.

There must be continuous monitoring of the quality of recovered halons. User industries, particularly in India, frequently reported that cheaper products had been found added to recovered halons in order to make its sale more profitable.

The establishment of an inventory of all installations with halons must be viewed as a very necessary aspect of halon management. In large countries, this represents a significant and complex task, which requires collaboration of central and provincial government agencies, fire authorities and the private sector. A comprehensive coverage of all sectors and installations may not be a practical proposition. There is need to prioritize the operations which will vary from country to country. Coverage of certain critical regions and industries (army, aviation and oil industry), would provide coverage of 75% to 80% initially. When the scope is extended at later stages, it would cover 95% of recoverable halon. This would allow for better management, control, and more economical and successful operations.

A gradual phase-out of halon installations is preferable to a rapid pace forced by administrative decree. The latter could overburden R&R facilities and cause unnecessary costs for users, as the experience of Malaysia showed.

Government support might be needed and should be considered to sustain the halon bank operation. When national interests and strategic needs require it, government subsidies should be considered. Critical sectors like civil aviation, military, petroleum and electricity generation should be asked to support the banking operations and halon storage costs based on their current needs and projected requirements. With industry involvement and cost sharing there will be serious and continuous self-evaluation of future needs of the industry and from the beginning the commitment to phase-out. The awareness of the limited quantity available and the cost of maintaining halon in stock will be a deterrent for continued usage. There will be a serious attempt on the part of the industry to find suitable alternatives and phase-out all existing installations.

The viability of a sustained operation would depend upon the industry, the role of the agencies (government) and careful evaluation of the peculiarities of the country, its needs and prevailing situation. There cannot be a single formula, but the basic criteria listed above need to be given weight. To build a consensus for a strategy might not be easy and will take time.

X. Halon-related Activities Implemented by UNEP
(a) Overview

UNEP has played an early catalytic role in the halon sector, particularly in halon banking as a result of Parties decision IV/26 requesting UNEP to function as a clearinghouse for information
relevant to international halon bank management. UNEP was requested to liaise with and coordinate its activities with the Implementing Agencies to encourage Parties to provide pertinent information to the clearinghouse.

91. UNEP’s halon-sector assistance to Article 5 countries to date under the Multilateral Fund has comprised three types of activities: the International Halon Bank Clearinghouse (TAS), Publications (TAS), and Workshops (TRA/TAS) (see Table 4 below). Total funds disbursed were US $711,595 of US$718,000 approved. In some cases, significant delays occurred.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Projects Approved</th>
<th>Number of Projects Completed</th>
<th>Total Funds Approved (US$)</th>
<th>Total Funds Disbursed (US$)</th>
<th>Delays (Months)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Handbooks</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25,000</td>
<td>25,000</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>75,000</td>
<td>75,000</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information Clearing House</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>100,000</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>35,000</td>
<td>35,000</td>
<td>8 and 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>29,000</td>
<td>29,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>174,000</td>
<td>174,000</td>
<td>0 and 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting/Workshops</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>43,595</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>718,000</td>
<td>711,595</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Excludes one cancelled project

Source: Inventory

92. UNEP has also:

(a) Supported bilaterals (i.e. Canada, France and Germany) in the implementation of regional halon bank projects in West Asia and the Caribbean;

(b) Disseminated information related to national halon management strategies in Article 5 countries (as per Decision X/7) in co-operation with the Ozone Secretariat; and

(c) Assisted the Halon Technical Options Committee with data collection activities.

93. In addition to specific guidance provided by the Executive Committee, UNEP also follows the technical guidance of the Halons Technical Options Committee (HTOC) for its activities related to this sector. It regularly consults the HTOC Co-Chairs in the design of major projects and has involved them and HTOC members in various projects undertaken in the past, e.g. as lead authors or quality reviewers. UNEP also refers to and disseminates HTOC reports and HTOC Technical Notes to Article 5 countries.

94. To date, UNEP has relied on external technical experts related to the halon sector. Under the Compliance Assistance Programme (CAP), one Halon Phase-out Officer will be recruited in UNEP’s Regional Office for West Asia in Bahrain in 2003 to provide technical and policy services to all
Article 5 countries in the halon sector. The function and duties of this officer are available at www.uneptie.org/ozonaction/aboutus/va/waho.htm.

(b) Publications

95. UNEP has produced and disseminated six publications and two information papers to date as part of approved projects for the halon sector:

(a) Halon Management: Banking for the Future
(b) Eliminating Dependency on Halons: Self-Help Guide for Low-Volume Consuming Countries
(c) Eliminating Dependency on Halons: Case Studies
(d) Standards and Codes of Practice to Eliminate Dependency on Halons: Handbook of Good Practices in the Halon Sector
(e) Report and Proceedings of Regional Halon Conference and Workshop (Kuala Lumpur, 18-20 January 1994)
(f) List of National Halon Banks
(g) List of Halon Recycling, Recovery and Reclaim Equipment Manufacturers

96. UNEP has also produced and disseminated the following publications as part of other projects (i.e. not halon sector) but with some halon-related content:

(a) OzonAction Newsletter
(b) Up-date of Regulations to Control ODS
(c) Maintaining Military Readiness by Managing Ozone Depleting Substances: Guidelines for Armed Forces in Developing Countries
(d) Two Challenges, One Solution: Case Studies of Technologies that Protect the Ozone Layer and Mitigate Climate Change

97. Some interviewed Ozone officers and representatives of financial intermediaries of the World Bank who have been active for years in the Halon phase-out programme in Article 5 countries had recollection of UNEP publications, while those involved only recently were quite vague about their awareness of the publications or the technical and general guidelines available from UNEP. They recalled no specifics or details and admitted that they have only occasionally used them as resource material.
98. The initial need was for general information, understanding and technology guidance. The publications, for example “Eliminating Dependency on Halon – Case Studies”, provide a wealth of information and seem adequate to provide the guidance needed to formulate a legal and policy framework. They are useful even though there are country specific peculiarities advocated in some of the publications with regard to the adoption of laws, regulations and control measures.

99. Some difficulties were reported in sourcing specific information from the different documents and publications of UNEP. Specific answers are more in demand now than general technical information, in particular with regard to on-going activities like halon banking, recovery and recycling and the introduction of substitute agents and systems. The present need is for technical information sheets, specific to the topic. This format has been adopted by NFPA (USA) and LPC (UK), for example. Their publications normally do not have more than 3 or 4 pages and can easily be compiled in ring files. Additional information as and when necessary can be introduced using the same reference allowing for easy compilation and reference by consultants, fire safety officers, owners and management.

100. There is no clear indication to the extent that information provided on the web has provided assistance to persons involved in the implementation of halon phase-out. About 50 queries related to halons are received each year from persons in Article 5 countries. Ozone officers and representatives of financial intermediaries of the World Bank interviewed, however, rather recalled benefits from workshops and publications for technical knowledge. Though they are aware of the availability of information on the web, there seems to be little recourse to it.

(c) Specific Information about Halon Substitutes

101. Manufacturers and distributors of alternate systems and agents for halon often used pressure groups to promote their products and obtain acceptance or approval. Fire Authority Officers in Article 5 countries, in particular in low volume consuming countries, involved in technical evaluations of ODS-substitutes are not always able to provide a well-informed recommendation. This is often due to insufficient exposure to the technicalities involved in the evaluation of occupant’s safety and property protection needs, and is common when officers change positions frequently.

102. The promoters often try to influence those involved in the approval of substitutes and, with their product knowledge and technical back-up, impress the approving authorities and overcome inexperienced technical evaluators. Many products have been approved for application in Article 5 countries that in developed countries are still pending due to health and life risks and environmental concerns.

103. The UNEP publications provide some guidance with regard to standards and codes for alternative agents but do not inform about specific products. Most of the national and international standards and codes do not adequately address the needs and situations in Article 5 countries and often make reference to manufacturer’s requirements or specifications. These provisions are often taken advantage of promoters of alternative agents and technologies. For example, it is surprising to find so many drop-in substitutes for halon 1301 that are being promoted in Article 5 countries. Lists of alternative agents approved for use sometimes do not specify use in occupied or unoccupied areas, as total flooding or streaming agents, thus leaving fire fighters without clear information about risks for occupants.
104. Standards and codes that are adopted in various countries should be easily accessible from National Steering Committees or the Ozone Units. UNEP documents could provide not only guidance but also specific information that would reflect and take into account various critical requirements, preferably in form of short specific documents and not as part of a larger publication in order to provide easy reference and the necessary impact. Such work should be provided under the CAP Programme, guided by the halon officer under recruitment, and may also use parts of the funding for UNEP’s Global Public Awareness Programme.

(d) UNEP’s Role in Facilitating Contacts for Halon Trading

105. UNEP, in consultation with the HTOC, designed and launched a Business-to-Business web portal, the On-line Halon Trader (www.halontrader.org) in 2001. This web site is designed for companies that use halons in critical applications, including owners, managers and/or operators of fire protection systems, fire control services and other organizations related to fire protection. Through this free service, companies that need halon for critical applications ("halon seekers") are able to post listings of specific demand in a virtual marketplace. Companies or halon banks that can meet this demand with recovered, reclaimed or recycled halon ("halon providers") can respond or post their own listings about halons available for exchange. UNEP provides the platform for this exchange and does not in any manner become party to the transaction between those who seek halons and those who provide halons.

106. Table 5 below shows the quantities of halons offered and demanded, as of June 2003. In comparison, total halon consumption of Article 5 countries in 2000 was 4,736 ODP tonnes according to the HTOC Report 2002:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Halon</th>
<th>Number of postings</th>
<th>Quantity of halon (MT) posted</th>
<th>Quantity of halon (ODP tonnes) posted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1211</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1966.26</td>
<td>5,898.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1301</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2077.83</td>
<td>20,778.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2402</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>220.3</td>
<td>1,321.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>4,264.39</td>
<td>27,998.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Seekers</th>
<th>Number of postings</th>
<th>Quantity of halon (MT) posted</th>
<th>Quantity of halon (ODP tonnes) posted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1211</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>253.1</td>
<td>759.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1301</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1226.5</td>
<td>12,265.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2402</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1585</td>
<td>9,510.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>3,064.60</td>
<td>22,534.30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: UNEP/DTIE

107. These postings have been made by registered users reflecting 13 types of organisations from 21 countries (10 Article 5 and 11 non-Article 5). The types of organisations are: Fire equipment manufacturers (18), Halon recovery, recycling and/or reclaim service (10), Fire equipment vendor (10), Other (8), Fire extinguishing agent producer (5), Government agency (3), Halon banks (3), Halon users (4), NOU (1), Research institution (1).
108. UNEP has not identified any confirmed transactions resulting from postings on the Online Halon Trader as the business transactions remain private. However, the continued postings by organisations (in some cases multiple) and comments from users indicate the usefulness of this service. It is noteworthy that halon banks (Australia, Denmark, Spain, UK) and a number of national and multinational fire protection equipment vendors are registered users with postings.

109. Another form of halon trading is through national halon bank clearinghouses which UNEP promotes through the On-line Halon Trader, publications and query responses.

110. The quality of halons from sources advertised on the web is not known. Of the 132 postings on the On-line Halon Trader, 20 were classified as “reclaimed” by the person making the posting and 112 were classified as “recycled”, although there is no way to verify these statements. However, virtually all countries offering halons on the On-line Halon Trader are known to have halon banking and/or recycling facilities.

111. The purchasers are often not countries or agents searching to cover their critical needs to sustain the existing halon systems, but rather traders who obtain halon at low prices and resell later to the highest bidder or build up their halon bank for sale at later date when higher prices will have increased.

112. In designing the On-line Halon Trader, UNEP tried to ensure the integrity of the system by including a mandatory “Terms of Service” agreement that each user must accept before registering with the systems and posting any data. The terms applicable to Halon Providers includes the following statement: “The halons listed by my organization through this web module are recovered, recycled, reclaimed or banked, and they are not newly-produced (“virgin”) halons being sold for the first time”. Statements by Halon Seekers include: “My organization has endeavoured to reduce, avoid, or eliminate the use of halons to the maximum extent feasible, and is seeking recovered, recycled, reclaimed or banked halons for an essential or critical use.” Although there is no enforcement mechanism, this approach is meant to raise awareness about the sources and types of halons being offered and to steer people towards using halons only for critical purposes.

113. The amount of halons offered on the On-line Halon Trader exceeds the current overall halon consumption reported (2000) by Article 5 countries (see Table 5 above), therefore the system has significant potential in supporting the critical uses of halon in those countries. Nevertheless, it is possible that the halon offered in response to demands on the web is not in excess of domestic needs to sustain critical and strategic uses of certain Article 5 countries, as most of them are yet to formulate their essential requirements for the future. Countries like Malaysia have been offered good prices by operators of halon banks in Australia, Britain and USA interested in buying excess halons. These halon banks will offer halons to other countries or users when prices will have increased. However, Article 5 countries which offer halons for sale now while not having a plan for covering their strategic or critical needs could face shortage or non-availability of halons to meet such needs later on.

114. UNEP should take into account such risk, through publicity and awareness programme, to ensure that the countries disposing halon stocks are not sacrificing their strategic and national safeguards of the future. Information about halon management should provide guidance for Article 5 countries to work out the needs of critical and strategic sectors. It should be specific (civil aviation, bunker protection, military application, etc.), with modalities to work out the halon requirements of the critical and strategic sectors over the next 20 years, including recommendations as to how the
strategic stock can be built up from existing systems, imports, regional cooperation or government-to-government agreement.
Annex I

Overview of Projects and Funds Approved for Halon Phase-Out

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sector Plan Funding As Per Agreement (US$)</th>
<th>Number of Fire Extinguisher Projects</th>
<th>Funding for Fire Extinguisher Projects (US$)</th>
<th>HB-R&amp;R Projects* (US$)</th>
<th>Funding for Demonstration Projects (US$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>62,000,000</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,225,592</td>
<td>1,864,220</td>
<td>90,437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2,600,000</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1,623,126</td>
<td>579,400</td>
<td>265,381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>175,372</td>
<td>798,850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>610,956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>259,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>340,620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Republic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>58,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>431,730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1,771,145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>500,000</td>
<td>486,200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>563,000</td>
<td>382,250</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macedonia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>527,223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>499,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77,555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>114,108</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region: AFR</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>650,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region: ASP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>510,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region: LAC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>302,252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia and Montenegro</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>249,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>343,472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>568,000</td>
<td>420,750</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>62,375</td>
<td>18,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uruguay</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>64,600,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>23</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,831,573</strong></td>
<td><strong>12,700,577</strong></td>
<td><strong>389,818</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Halon Banking and Recovery and Recycling Projects including related Technical Assistance and Training

Source: Inventory
Annex II

Overview of Planned and Actual Phase-out Schedules in the Halon Sector Phase-out Plan for China

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>H1211 Production Planned</th>
<th>H1211 Production Actual</th>
<th>H1211 Consumption Planned</th>
<th>H1211 Consumption Actual</th>
<th>H1301 Production Planned</th>
<th>H1301 Production Actual</th>
<th>H1301 Consumption Planned</th>
<th>H1301 Consumption Actual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>10849</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>7218</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>2832</td>
<td>618</td>
<td>428</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>2436</td>
<td>600*</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>36.35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>1990*</td>
<td>600*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>1,990</td>
<td>600</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>1,990</td>
<td>600</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SEPA; all data in metric tons.

---
Annex III

Review of HBR&R Projects in Article 5 Countries Visited

(1) China

1. R&R machines from early projects implemented by USEPA and UNDP (CPR/HAL/12/INV/59 and 66) were seen and reported as being used in several locations. However, the lessons learnt in implementing these projects and presented in a final report by USEPA were confirmed (See Report on Desk Study on the Halon Projects, document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/37/6, p. 7-8). The report called for caution in the approach and named several preconditions required for successful R&R operations.

2. The planned halon banking project in Guangdong, funded under the HSPP, had an expected completion date of October 2001 but has not yet started. It is assumed to break even with 145 mt of halons recycled per year assuming a sales price of RMB 50,000/MT or 97MT selling for RMB 75,000/MT. It is very unlikely that the price projections for profitable operations will be realized, even after the closure of all halon production facilities in China. The demand for halon is diminishing with the phase-out and ban on all new installations. The delay in launching the project is intentional to avoid operating at a loss. Operations at the recycling centres at Tianjin and Dalian are also not viable with the prevailing prices and collapsing market for halons.

3. No new halon 1211 and 1301 installations are permitted by Fire Fighting Bureaus (FFB). There is no information from the armed forces to the exact size of their needs or their future policy. The existing systems are being replaced by alternative agents. The only visible need is for systems accidentally discharged. There is no national database to refer to. Limited information available is from the Guangdong FFB which conducted a survey several years ago within their own area of jurisdiction. The policy of the FFBs is to phase-out all existing halon systems in the quickest way possible. The need for a halon Bank is yet being felt.

4. The banking centre in Guangdong will probably be a technically superior facility if brought into operation. Its effectiveness will depend on market forces (supply/demand and prices for halons) and efficiency of operations. It is doubtful that it will ever become a profitable operation. As the introduction of alternate agents will further reduce the demand for halons, even from critical sectors, there will be reduced sales, higher holding costs and longer time periods for the banks’ operations.

5. Hopes are currently placed on improved demand and increased prices after halon production will cease. However, it is unlikely that the demand or the prices will improve and that recycling will play a major role, as the scope of applications (essential uses) is diminishing. It will be effective in meeting some of the critical user needs, like for the armed forces, provided the users are willing to pay double the market price, or if the operation is heavily subsidised. The future role of recycling may be rather that of a receiving centre for surrendered halons for storage and destruction.
6. As halon 1211 and 1301 systems go out of service, there is a need to establish a system of collection, storage and facilities for their destruction. Failure to anticipate this situation will result in much of the halon dissipating into the atmosphere. If quantified, the amount could be larger than several years of production phased-out. Not only contaminated halons but also excess quantities flooding the market without buyers have to be collected. There must be a plan in place to recall or collect these halon fire extinguishers at regional centres and provide facilities for its storage and ultimate destruction.

(2) India

7. The halon banking and management project for India, approved at the 32nd meeting of the Executive Committee to be implemented jointly with Australia and Canada, experienced a delay. The Ozone Cell had to organize a process of consultation and consensus building before being able to undertake the commitment requested by the Executive Committee as condition for the approval that India would establish a ban for producing and importing halons within 6 months after the reclamation centre had been set up.

8. At the time of the mission’s visit in September 2002, this commitment had been given in writing by the Ozone Cell and first contracts with consulting companies in Canada and Australia had been signed. The Banking and Recycling facilities were under construction and were expected to be ready in the second half of 2003, inauguration is now scheduled for September/October 2003. The planned halon storage capacity is 5 MT.

9. Some uncertainties with regard to future project implementation and sustainability were identified by the evaluation mission. The new director of the project counterpart institution, the Defence Institute of Fire Research (DIFR), declared that DIFR works only for the armed forces but not for civil industries, and it seemed that the DIFR might not be able and willing to establish and maintain a country-wide database which, in any case, would require close cooperation with the authorities in individual states. According to information received by the NOU in June 2003, these issues have been resolved. Once the banking facility is ready and commissioned, the Essential Uses Panel would be set up for working out details for identification of various specific sectors and sub-sectors and their demand for halons. The concrete work will be carried out by national consultants working also with local authorities. It is a pre-requisite towards rationalized decommissioning and management of halon installations.

10. During this work, the following supplementary elements of the halon bank should be considered:

(a) In situ management of halon banks at various installations after decommissioning.
(b) Large cooperations and institutions (NTPC, ONGC, Railways, ports, Refineries, Etc.) might manage separate facilities in various regional centres.
(c) Purchase, sale, and exchange of halon between groups in a region.
(d) Such regional and in-situ banks need to be monitored by the Ozone Cell, in close cooperation with government authorities in individual states.

11. There seems to be little guidance to contractors on servicing and dismantling of existing halon installations. Halon cylinders removed from installations decommissioned were kept at a contractor’s site. The quality of the contents was suspect. They had not been recycled and there was vague indication that they may be used to service approved halon installations. A training course on dismantling halon installations is planned to be conducted once the reclamation centre will have become operational.

(3) Brazil

12. Brazil received R&R equipment for halon 1301 and a recovery pump for halon 1211 through a project implemented with Environment Canada. The company GESPI, which operates the equipment under Government contract seems to well maintain it and keeps it fully operative, after some repairs which they were able to do themselves. The reported quantities of recycled halon 1301 were around 3 metric metric tonnes for each of the last 4 years. These volumes were questioned in later discussions and might actually be only around 50% of the indicated level. In addition to recycling halon 1301, the company imports 500 kg per year of halon 1211 from Belgium for the use of smaller regional airlines and the air force.

13. The NOU reported imports of halon 1301 of 2 metric metric tonnes for 2002. It needs to be clarified whether this is new or recycled halon. Only the latter would be legal under Brazilian legislation (import ban for new halons). Interested customers reportedly renounced on buying halons from Chinese and Indian suppliers after they refused to certify the purity of each batch. Estimations of installed capacities of H1301 and H1211 vary between 250 mt in the country programme and 400 MT according to some sector experts. These figures are significantly below the minimum level required for a country to become eligible for a reclamation center (250 Mt of H1301 and 1000 MT of H1211). The exception was justified with the demonstration character of the Brazilian project which was approved intersessionally between the 18th and 19th meeting of the Executive Committee, just after approval of the Halon Banking Guidelines at the 18th Meeting.
14. The main Brazilian airline Varig has recently installed their own recovery equipment which came as a surprise to all other stakeholders. So far Varig had used mainly servicing facilities in the USA. There was apparently a break up with GESPI over high prices charged by GESPI for recycled halons resulting in Varig looking for other service providers. GESPI had asked for up to US $100 per kg of recycled halon before lowering the price about two years ago. Currently the service fee is US $15 per kg. Petrobras on the other hand uses the services of GESPI. In 2001, Petrobras lost an oil platform due to a major fire which could not be contained because the installed halon based fire fighting system was not operational. After that incident which cost the life of 9 workers, Petrobras organized a full check up and upgrade of all installed fire fighting equipment resulting in some orders for GESPI. Some other important halon users like commercial banks have either converted already, mainly to FM 200 or INERGEN or are waiting for the price of recycled halon to rise in order to lower the conversion cost.

15. The fire fighting authorities see halon as being used for property protection and therefore falling under the full responsibility of the property owners. They consider themselves responsible only for personnel safety and life saving and focus on water based systems. They do not check the halon based equipment and do not provide certificates. Halon equipment is checked by internal staff of companies and by consultants working for insurance companies. There are no Brazilian standards for halon based equipment and systems, so either ISO or US standards are applied. Currently a working group is preparing standards for FM 200 and INERGEN. Finalization is expected to take 2 to 3 years.

16. Project implementation was delayed by conflicts between the former project implementing agency CETESB (the State Environment Protection Agency of Sao Paulo) and the federal environment protection office IBAMA which has a branch office in Sao Paulo and is reactivating the project now. CETESB renounced on further carrying out project activities and supervising GESPI in autumn 2001. Meetings of the steering committee were stopped and no further training programmes took place. This continued throughout 2002 and until today, partly also as result of uncertainty with regard to the change of government at the beginning of January of this year. There are still about 20,000 US $ left in the project account which is subject to dispute between CETESB and IBAMA and blocks the full transfer of project implementation responsibilities to IBAMA.

17. IBAMA and the NOU are currently discussing how to finalize the project. Besides arranging the outstanding issues with CETESB, they consider organizing a bidding for the R&R equipment which had been given to GESPI without an open tender. However, they would need to find a similarly qualified company which is well connected to potential and actual users of recycled halons. It might be more promising to reactivate the steering committee or to form a supervisory group of main users in order to monitor price levels charged by GESPI. In addition, imports of recycled halons should be authorized also for other companies in order to allow some competition in the market and to keep prices at reasonable levels. Furthermore, an awareness campaign to inform main users of the long term availability of recycled halons at reasonable prices would be useful.
(4) Malaysia

18. Until 1990, about 150,000 units of Halon 1211 fire extinguishers were manufactured each year, 30% of which were exported. An estimated 1,000,000 units (2 kg and 3 kg) were installed in Malaysia with a total capacity of about 2,500 MT. As per administrative order, from 1990 onwards there were no more new halon 1211 fire extinguishers installed and existing halon fire extinguishers were not certified for further use but had to be recovered within a 2 year period. As fire stations were also fire extinguisher servicing centres, the R&R project to be implemented by the World Bank was to place 50 units of halon 1211 R&R machines at fire stations and train 100 trainers and 500 technicians (firemen). Even the 50 units would have been hard pressed to service 1,000,000 extinguishers at 80 units per day over 1 year or 40 units per day over a two-year period.

19. However, the Government changed the project concept and decided to set up a halon bank with a H1310 recycling machine instead of distributing 50 R&R units for H1211 to the fire stations. Thus, only 2 R&R machines for H1211 were left which had been received under a global project implemented by UNDP but they have not been used either.

20. The result was that thousands of halon fire extinguishers piled up at fire stations. Many fire stations refused to accept the fire extinguishers and so they were just discarded by the owners. It is reported that these extinguishers were found leaking at many of the fire stations. Of the estimated 2,500 MT of halon 1211 only 4.3 MT was recycled for the Electricity Board. These were part of the earlier fixed installations and not from portable fire extinguishers.

21. Of the estimated 2,000 to 2,500 MT of halon 1301 in installations 553 MT or 25% has been registered, 83 MT collected and 3.7 MT recycled. According to the contractor, 35.8 MT halon 1301 was collected and 5 MT was recycled. The contractor claimed that the recovery rate for Halon 1301 was only 50% and that there were no contaminants. He admitted not being able to use the Gas Chromatograph to identify the pollutants, however.

22. The halon bank operator had no appreciation of the policy objectives of the project, but rather viewed it as an opportunity to enhance his business. Fifty percent recovery rate reported by the contractor is incomprehensible. It lends weight to allegations that halon collected was illegally exported, sold to service existing halon systems and passed on as HFC 227 ea through unscrupulous contractors. Contractors and suppliers interviewed indicated that this was common market knowledge.

23. As already indicated by the previous R&R evaluation in 2000, (see document UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/31/18 para. 49), the Government took over the Halon Bank Management in January 2000 and the equipment was moved in May 2000 to the Central Fire Training School. However, since the transfer, the Halon 1211 recycling machines are unused, and the Halon 1301 recycling machine has been out of order. Attempts to repair it did not succeed.

24. The Halon Taskforce Committee (HTC) was set up in 1999 and chaired by the Fire Services Department. At the moment, only 2 applications are approved by HTC as "essential uses", i.e military and civil aviation. The Environmental Quality (Halon Management) Regulation 1999 came into force by January 2000. A Standard Operating Manual was established under HTC to verify the quality of recovered halons.
25. Most of the training programmes, awareness programmes and seminars conducted in Malaysia have had no lasting effect, beneficial to the halon phase-out. Instead, they became a platform for promotion of alternative products without proper understanding. Alternative products or applications, that have been restricted or rejected in other countries due to their inherent risks for occupants safety in case of fires, for example HCFC-123 for total flooding, have been approved, sometimes under pressure.

26. There is no national programme policy or strategy formulated to meet the critical and strategic needs of the country for halon. Malaysian operators should have identified the main sectors (electricity generation, telecommunication, petroleum/chemical industries, civil aviation and armed forces), established a detailed inventory and introduced monitoring and reporting of these installations. The Fire Services Act and The Uniform Building By-laws stipulate maintenance in accordance to the relevant standards and codes and as per directive and requirement of the Fire Services Department. There should have been a planned withdrawal (dismantling) by way of prior notice to owners in line with the R&R capacity of equipment installed. As per information received, the capacity for recycling H1301 is 100kg/day. Working 300 days per year, 30 MT could be processed each year.

27. The funding for the continued (prolonged) operation of the HBR&D project and the holding costs should have been subsidised by the government. A phased retirement of existing halon fixed installations, as alternative agents become available, is better than a hasty decommissioning following an administrative decree.

(5) Venezuela

28. Halon banking and recovery recycling in Venezuela consists of the operation of one halon 1301 reclamation centre, including a halon 1211 recovery pump, provided under a project implemented by Environment Canada, and two halon 1211 recovery and recycling machines provided by an earlier project implemented by USEPA, with associated training and other equipment.

29. Neither of the two halon 1211 recovery and recycling equipment delivered under the USEPA project are currently working. Technofuego, a systems manufacturer, has one of the two machines and has tried to replace some of the aluminum parts of the equipment that have corroded. It also tooled a replacement pump for the one in the machine that had corroded, but it was not possible to make the machine run. The other 1211 machine has been contracted to another firm, but it does not work. The operator selected did not fare well because he lacked experience in servicing of halon fire extinguishers and systems, did not have enough finances to sustain the operation or provide the necessary inducements, could only provide limited service, and could not extend his services to all regions of the country. Moreover, it is estimated that only about 800 units with approx. 1,200 kg of halon are still in service and are being phased-out through natural attrition, resulting in little demand for R&R of halon 1211.
30. The halon 1301 reclamation equipment, scale, and mass-spec testing equipment were all functional. Technofuego is the contractor. The company had trouble with a leak in the reclamation equipment that resulted in the emission of 40 lbs of halon 1301. The leak was repaired and there have been no further problems. Filters need to be replaced frequently but they can be purchased locally.

31. All of the equipment is owned by the Government through FONDOIN who signs annual contracts with commercial equipment manufacturers and servicing centres to operate the equipment. The contractor charges about US $18-25/lb. for reclaimed halon 1301 and pays US $3/lb. for halon 1301 that it buys from excess supplies and then reclaims through the Fund-purchased equipment. Technofuego is required to pay US $0.10 per lb of halon that it buys to FONDOIN. FONDOIN requires monthly reporting on the amount of halon purchased, sold and being held by Technofuego.

32. The quantities of recycled halon 1211 reached a peak of about 1,700 lbs in 1998, varied between 800 and 1,100 lbs from 1999 to 2001 and came down to about 500 lbs in 2002, with a further decline in 2003. For halon 1301 the figures were significantly higher, mostly between 5,000 and 8,000 lbs between 1999 and 2001 before declining sharply to less than 1,000 lbs in 2002 and shrinking further in 2003.

33. There was no import of halon since 1994, although there is no import ban as required by the guidelines. Nevertheless, there is an effective ban since regulations require the approval of the Ministry of the Environment for any imports or exports of both new and recycled halon which is not granted. The Government also had indicated early on that there would be no further imports of halon equipment, which made all equipment suppliers realize that they had to pursue alternatives. The halon ban is now in the office of the President for signature. The ban will extend also to imports and exports of equipment containing halon which currently require a license from the Ministry of Environment.

34. A key factor for the success of the halon bank project was to find a private contractor having the confidence of its competitors who in turn agreed to the level of service fees charged, jointly with FONDOIN. Another key factor was that the project focused on R&R of H1301 for fixed systems in the critical use sectors: petroleum industry, airlines, Caracas metro, banks, electricity suppliers, armed services, and the mining industry.

35. Concern was expressed about the quality of imported substitutes, in particular FM-200 from China. In general, FM-200 is the alternative of choice for fixed systems although Inergen is also available at a similar price. Water mist systems have not been purchased largely due to the poor quality of water. Fire Authorities were not concerned about halon or its alternatives since their use had mostly to do with protecting capital investments instead of occupants safety. For the latter, they prefer water-based systems.

36. Neither FONFOIN nor the halon bank contractor pursued the regionalization of the project, mainly because of import restrictions for recovered halons which are classified as hazardous waste.
Executive Summary of the Evaluation of the Halon Sector Phase-Out Programme in the PR China

(a) Context of the Evaluation

1. The evaluation of halon projects in China is part of the halon sector evaluation foreseen in the 2002 and 2003 Monitoring and Evaluation Work Programmes.

2. 34,187 ODP tonnes of halons was the baseline consumption in China which obtained 72.2% of all approved funding in the halon sector of Article 5 countries. Early investment and non-investment projects only partly succeeded, as described in the Desk Study on Halon Projects. At its 23rd meeting in November 1997, the Executive Committee approved in principle US $ 62 million for a sector plan to approach the phase-out in a comprehensive manner. Under the sector plan, total phase-out of consumption and production of halon 1211 will be realized in 2006 and of halon 1301 in 2010. So far six annual tranches with a total funding of US $ 46.8 million have been approved by the Executive Committee.

(b) Methodology

3. The participatory evaluation approach was used, in line with the terms of reference. This approach which focuses on dialogue and inputs from all stakeholders is compatible with the flexibility clause which implies national decision-making and reporting of overall results rather than detailed accountability. In addition, the participatory approach enhances the distinctiveness of an evaluation exercise as contrasted to an audit.

4. The evaluation mission to China took place in March 2002. halon producers, fire extinguisher and systems manufacturers, fire research institutes, fire bureaus, and halon recycling centers were visited in various provinces. Extensive discussions were held with representatives from SEPA and MPS (Ministry for Public Security) who were very helpful to provide information and support the organization of the mission. The Fund’s Secretariat actively participated throughout the evaluation exercise. Likewise, the World Bank, as implementing agency, also provided support before and during the evaluation mission.

5. Data collection methods used were those applicable to evaluate results at sector rather than project level, with a focus on outcomes in terms of halon phase-out achieved and supporting activities completed.

(c) Main Findings and Lessons Learnt

6. The halon phase-out process proceeds in line with the agreement approved at the 23rd meeting of the Executive Committee. halon production and consumption is now below the allowed levels, the market for halon 1301 seems to be particularly depressed. The only remaining 1301 producer in Zheijiang stopped production about a year ago and still has 500 mt in stock. The reactor can be reactivated any time but needs one month of preparatory work before actual production could start. The annual production capacity is about 1,000 mt of halon 1301. Theoretically halon 1211 could also be produced but there are no indications that this is intended.
The two remaining halon 1211 producers work likewise on a campaign-basis, with an estimated two weeks of preparations needed each time before production is started.

7. The Audit Reports (which focus on the production sector) and the World Bank’s Annual Reports (dealing with the previous year’s status of implementation and the following year’s annual programmes) provide reliable and sufficient information to the ExCom to decide on the proposed annual tranches. No deviations from KPMG audit reports were observed, and KPMG answered satisfactorily questions sent to them by the production sector consultant after the mission.

8. There is adequate availability of alternatives to halons at sufficiently attractive prices to fire equipment manufacturers and to consumers, to enable the continued phase-out of halons without damaging the country’s fire fighting capability. However, enterprises which have invested in ABC powder production capacity, especially those which have converted from halon 1211 manufacture, generally have been disappointed by the poor profitability due to strong competition and similarity with low-priced BC powder. This was reported by manufacturers of ABC powder as well as of fire extinguishers. As a result, some dissatisfaction with the conversion was reported, although this disappointment also demonstrates a lack of sound business planning by the companies. For example, there seems to be limited market research conducted by companies with the result that investments are made based on what they are able to produce rather than what might be needed in terms of future market demand. Similarly, the insistence on use of equipment suited to highly industrialized societies, under Chinese conditions, may be a cost burden which could inhibit success.

9. The assumed viability of halon banking was based on certain price projections running the halon bank, and market volumes. Due to the shrinking internal demand and low prices for halons in China and in the international market the strategy must be reconsidered. The enterprise foreseen for running the halon bank, one of the largest manufacturers of fire extinguishing equipment based in Guangdong, did not start recycling operations yet and will most likely not do so before a price increase of halons would make it more attractive. National security concerns, might overrule the economic viability criteria, but it may be necessary that the banking operations will be subsidised. However, critical applications will have to be reduced to a minimum due to the high holding costs of halon in centralized storage facilities.

10. The bidding process worked well in the first year, with numerous halon producers participating. However, when halon prices increased temporarily the remaining producers complained about lost profits but were pushed to accept similar compensation levels as the previous bid winners. There is no illegal production as the market demand is lower than the production quotas. The capacities of the 2 remaining producers of halon 1211 and one of 1301 could produce in one year stocks sufficient for several years of consumption. Complete phase-out ahead of the agreed schedule could be negotiated. For the companies, this would be more economical than occasional short production runs. However, it would require an amendment of the phase-out agreement.
11. The Halon Unit was established by the PMO in 1997. It comprises officials from the Fire Protection Bureau of the MPS, SEPA’s PMO, and CNCCC, the domestic implementing agency (DIA). It is headed by a senior official delegated from MPS and has its offices in SEPA which greatly facilitates interministerial coordination.

12. The provincial and municipal environmental protection authorities (EPA) and fire fighting bureaus (FFB), on behalf of SEPA and MPS, conduct random visits to beneficiary enterprises to confirm halon phase-out. CNCCC as the DIA carries out supervision of enterprise-level activities, under PMO’s supervision.

13. The leadership of MPS and SEPA was a decisive factor for the HSPP’s successful implementation. The WB played a catalytic role in building on existing capacities, strengths and experiences from SEPA, MPS, FFB and others, by coordinating and linking initiatives through partnerships. This amplified national and local ownership of the HSPP.

14. The installed institutional infrastructure, together with the policies and economic instruments applied, has been the decisive factor for the on-going success of HSPP. Because such an effective institutional infrastructure is indispensable, it remains uncertain as to whether the Sector Approach can universally be the best means to achieving ODS phase-out. The economic liberalization in China allowed to combine a strong central leadership and oversight with market mechanisms like the auction system which enhanced transparency and cost-effectiveness.

15. The conversion of enterprises was made easier by the PR China’s unparalleled economic growth in the last two decades which provided new business opportunities in or outside the fire fighting sector. The phased elimination of halons created opportunities for substitutes which were seized upon by commercial organizations which built in recent years with large scale investments at least five HFC227ea plants and three HFC236fa installations, as well as a number of HFC23 units. This could be contrasted with MLF funding for two small and presently underutilized ABC powder plants which form only a fraction of installed production capacities in excess of 100,000 mt per year.

16. The halon phase-out has brought with it grant funding for modernizing the fire equipment manufacturing industry but it was also, along with the market liberalization, instrumental in up-rooting many of the old entrenched manufacturers who enjoyed a closed and protected market. With increasing competition and decreasing profit margins, only those producers who were able to expand their production and to realize sizable economies of scale survived and flourished. The sustainability of the converted companies depends on the quality, diversification and innovativeness of their products with the home market providing the volume and the export market providing the margins. Many of those who emerged as leaders have taken to globalization, quality production, market-orientated product line and volume production. The market-orientated economy also brought about a profit-motivated approach. The enforcing agencies have to face new challenges, as the manufacturing sector is increasingly profit-orientated and less focused on moral and social obligations.
17. The training of enterprises in bidding procedures seemed well targeted and user-friendly. Likewise, the campaign in awareness raising has been successful as most stakeholders contacted are clearly convinced of the long-term benefits of halon phase-out to the environment. Most of the efforts concerning public education, awareness and technical support resulted in successful outputs, such as the 2000 National Proceedings on Halon Phase-Out.

18. By contrast, the development of new building and product standards and codes, though vital in the context of the HSPP, appeared less successful. It was not possible to identify the timing of the expected outputs. The failure of developing and implementing national standards and codes resulted in provincial governments introducing their own standards and codes. Their FFB had to individually evaluate and decide the acceptability and applicability of the substitute agents. This gave rise to a multiplicity of codes and standards. Therefore, the enforcement of the phase-out differed between regions, resulting in situations where a ban on halon in one area could be circumvented by sourcing elsewhere. In the absence of national standards and codes for the introduction of new agents and systems like Inergen, HFC 227 and water mist, their development should have been addressed first and put on the fast track.

19. Funds committed for completed and on-going projects have amounted to US$ 13,602,733 for phase-down and closure of halon producers, US$ 7,432,106 for the conversion or closure of fire extinguisher and systems manufacturers, US$ 1,727,253 for technical assistance, and US$ 8,2165,000 for halon substitutes. This adds up to US$ 30,927,092 which represents 66% of the funding of US$ 46,800,000 approved in six annual tranches.

20. The average cost-effectiveness for fire extinguisher and system manufacturers is US$ 0.45 per kg of ODP phased-out, much below the threshold of US$ 1.48 per kg, assuming that only H1211 with a conversion factor of 1:3 is phased out, thereby neglecting H1301 with a higher conversion factor (1:10). Including it would show an even better cost-effectiveness.

(d) Recommendations

21. Consider a negotiated earlier phase-out date of halon production, in particular of halon 1301. This would require the companies to produce one or two years above their current quotas and build up a stockpile which would serve until 2006 for halon 1211 and until 2010 for halon 1301. Verification of such production and stockpiling would need to continue until 2010.

22. Accelerate the development of National Standards and Codes so that the industry moves forward with increasing step. The new standard for ABC powder at 75% phosphate content is being sidelined for 50% because the margins are better. There is need for greater awareness of the situation and for stricter enforcement. The pursuit of national standards for CO2 will require more investments in CO2 production facilities, testing and certification.
23. Prepare an in-depth feasibility study on halon banking, taking into account the following findings: (1) current trends indicate that, left to the market forces, halon banking and recycling operations may not be viable, (2) banking and recycling operations may have to be heavily subsidised to meet strategic needs, (3) if volumes become unmanageable, in-situ banking would be an option to reduce operational costs. Give the highest priority to the problem of collection, storage and safe disposal of halon in order to avoid substantial emissions due to leakages and venting.

24. Conduct a full and impartial market survey for present and anticipated halon substitutes using national and international expertise. This should help to guide investment planning in a broad sense. For example, rather than in investing in small ABC powder projects when the total capacity is already at some 100,000 mt per year, companies investing in substitutes such as HFC236fa and HFC227ea might be supported. Any funding of substitute production under the HSPP, which is covered by the flexibility clause, should be based on clear and credible business plans in order to ensure viability in a rapidly changing market while avoiding to distort the competition. Savings realized in conversion and closure projects might also be preserved to cover later cost for halon banking and destruction.

25. Analytical laboratories should be properly equipped to test all key specification elements of the intended chemicals, and, where appropriate, performance parameters as well (e.g. in the case of ABC Powder, which should be tested for tendency to caking, and moisture content). The retention of batch samples should be encouraged so that eventual market problems can be properly tracked.

26. Hong Kong has already phased out the use of halons in accordance with the schedule for non Art.5 countries. Lessons learnt in this process should be considered by SEPA.

27. To enable tracking data and analysis of documentation, ensure all documents are properly dated and referenced in a header/footer format and indicate if they are draft, approved, or superseding a previous document. A source or sponsor reference would also be helpful (e.g. World Bank, UNMFS, UNIDO, etc.) This procedure would be useful for facilitating follow-up by all stakeholders, in particular for evaluations.
Brazil

Project Title: Halon recycling and bank management
Project Description: Establishment of a halon bank (storage/transfer and provision of recycling and refurbishment facilities). It includes establishment of the Advisory Group, provision of halon 1211 and halon 1231 recycling and reclamation equipment, and laboratory analysis equipment (for others), development of a Halon Bank Management Program, training program and a workshop, and follow-up technology transfer implemented in cooperation with the Director of Environmental Quality, Companhia De Tecnologia De Saneamento Ambiental (Cetesb).

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/10/TAS/41 UNDP FIN TAS HAL Technical assistance/support
Project Description: Implementation of halon phase-out plan for China: transfer of technology on alternatives to halon fire protection systems and adoption of new standards for handling of halons, education and training through national and regional seminars and training courses. Implementation by the Fire Bureau of the Ministry of Public Security and the technical work by the Tianjin Fire Research Institute.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/10/TRA/57 USA FIN TRA HAL Training
Project Description: Development of a resource manual on halon uses and applications of halons extinguishers. The manual contains the use of halon alternatives, theoretical problems explaining halon in critical applications and new technologies developed. The information gathered has been used by the Ministry of Public Security the development of the halon phase-out strategy.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/10/INV/17 IBRD FIN INV HAL Extinction
Project Description: Establishment of a demonstration network of halon extinguishers Beijing ABC powder production project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/11/TAS/53 USA FIN TAS HAL Technical assistance/support
Project Description: Implementation of the halon phase-out plan for China: transfer of technology on alternatives to halons fire protection systems.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/11/TRA/53 USA FIN TAS HAL Technical assistance/support
Project Description: Establishment of a halon bank clearinghouse and provision of recycling and refurbishment facilities. It includes establishment of the Advisory Group, provision of recycling and refurbishment facilities available. It includes establishment of the Advisory Group, provision of halon 1211 and halon 1231 recycling and reclamation equipment, and laboratory analysis equipment (for others), development of a Halon Bank Management Program, training program and a workshop, and follow-up technology transfer implemented in cooperation with the Director of Environmental Quality, Companhia De Tecnologia De Saneamento Ambiental (Cetesb).

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/11/TRA/54 USA FIN TAS HAL Technical assistance/support
Project Description: Establishment of a demonstration network of halon extinguishers Beijing ABC powder production project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.

China

Project Title: China CPR/HAL/12/EV/98 USA FIN INV HAL Recovery/Byproduct
Project Description: Implementation of halon 1211 recovery/recycling project.
## Annex IV

### Details of Halon Projects in Article 5 Countries Visited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Subsector</th>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>ExCom Approval</th>
<th>ODP To Phased Out</th>
<th>Consumption</th>
<th>Production</th>
<th>Date Approved</th>
<th>Funds Traded</th>
<th>Funds Disbursed</th>
<th>Approval Cost-Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>CPR/30/45/DEM721</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>Sectional plan</td>
<td>halon phaseout plan in China, 1998 Annual Programme</td>
<td>The Executive Committee recalls its decision 226/7 and understands that this decision and the China Halon Sector Strategy embody a specific agreement with the Government of China. In the context of this agreement, several factors that are specific to China have been taken into account. In that regard, and while the Executive Committee recognizes this innovation for phasing out production and consumption of halons in China, the Executive Committee agrees that this agreement establishes no specific precedence (including audits and eligibility or ineligibility of funding for specific levels or specific names).</td>
<td>9,939.0</td>
<td>9,939.0</td>
<td>11,370.0</td>
<td>Nov-99 Dec-99</td>
<td>9,930,000</td>
<td>9,930,000</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>CPR/30/45/DEM721</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>Sectional plan</td>
<td>halon phaseout plan in China, 1998 Annual Programme</td>
<td>The ExCom at its 226 Meeting (Nov 1997) decided to approve in principle US $2 million in total funding for the implementation of the China Halon Sector Strategy, as per the general and specific conditions indicated in Decision 226/7(ProminExCom2/98).</td>
<td>3,712.0</td>
<td>3,712.0</td>
<td>5,070.0</td>
<td>Nov-98 Dec-98</td>
<td>10,800,000</td>
<td>10,800,000</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>CPR/30/45/DEM721</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>Sectional plan</td>
<td>halon phaseout plan in China, 2000 Annual Programme</td>
<td>During this phase, halon 1211 production will be reduced to a maximum of 3,100 MT and its consumption to a maximum of 3,500 MT in 2000. The halon 1301 production will be maintained at the agreed maximum level of 19 MT and consumption will be 300 MT. It will also continue actions to ensure that the fire fighting capacity is not undermined as the result of an insufficient supply of substitutes of satisfactory quality. The following activities are envisioned: (i) $4 million to buy back quotas and as a result closing 3 halon agent producers; (ii) $5.3 million to close and convert 10-15 fire extinguisher manufacturers; (iii) $0.4 million to support the phaseout in China, 1999 Annual Programme</td>
<td>3,712.0</td>
<td>3,712.0</td>
<td>5,070.0</td>
<td>Nov-98 Dec-98</td>
<td>10,800,000</td>
<td>10,800,000</td>
<td>1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>CPR/30/45/DEM721</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>Sectional plan</td>
<td>halon phaseout plan in China, 2001 Annual Programme</td>
<td>To request that future technical audits required under the agreement be submitted by the World Bank no later than 8 weeks prior to the meeting of the Executive Committee at which approval of funding was being sought.</td>
<td>5,370.0</td>
<td>5,370.0</td>
<td>5,826.0</td>
<td>Nov-99 Dec-99</td>
<td>12,400,000</td>
<td>12,400,000</td>
<td>0.87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*According to the 2002 Progress Reports

Source: Inventory and Progress Reports

Page 2 of 7
### China CPR/5AL5/INV/193

**Type**: Sectoral phaseout plan  
**Project Title**: Sector plan for halon phaseout in China, 2002 Annual Programme  
**Project Description**: China halon 1211 production and consumption will be reduced to a maximum of 2,654 metric tonnes, each. The halon 1301 production will be reduced to a maximum level of 890 metric tonnes; and consumption will be reduced to 150 metric tonnes. These reductions will be due to phase out in 2002 of 2,294 ODP tonnes in production and 2,000 ODP tonnes in consumption of halon. The 2002 Annual Programme includes the following activities: (a) $8,000,000 is to be used for halon phase-out activities; and (b) $2,889,000 is to be used for technical assistance activities in order to support the halon phase-out programme and ensure that existing fire protection requirements can be met. The Government will continue to implement bidding for decommissioning contracts for halon phase-out activities; rebuild fire protection systems; and strengthen the system.  
**Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out**: 2,654.0  
**Consumption ODP Phased Out**: 2,160.0  
**Production ODP To Be Phased Out**: 2,400.0  
**Production ODP Phased Out**: 1,600.0  
**Date Approved**: Dec-01  
**Date of Competition**: Dec-02  
**Funds Disbursed**: 3,700.000  
**Approved Cost-Effectiveness**: 1.29

### China CPR/5AL5/INV/195

**Type**: Sectoral phaseout plan  
**Project Title**: Sector plan for halon phaseout in China: 2003 annual programme  
**Project Description**: China halon 1211 production and consumption will be reduced to a maximum of 1,990 tonnes and 1,890 tonnes respectively. The halon 1301 production will be maintained at a maximum level of 200 metric tonnes. The Government will continue to implement and improve bidding for decommissioning contracts for halon phase-out activities. It will ensure that the details of the ban will be disseminated to prospective consumers through the news media, bulletins, etc., through the local fire services and environmental protection bureaux; and introduce stricter controls for the sale of halons.  
**Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Consumption ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Date Approved**: Nov 02  
**Date of Competition**: Dec 03  
**Funds Disbursed**: 5,900.000  
**Approved Cost-Effectiveness**: 2.57

### India IND/HAL/13/DEM/28

**Type**: Technical assistance/support  
**Project Title**: Demonstration and evaluation of alternative technology for halon fire protection system and technical assistance for national strategy for ODS phase out  
**Project Description**: Demonstration of the following fire extinguishing alternative technologies: (i) fine response sprinkler system, (ii) water misting systems both low pressure and high pressure, (iii) foam systems, (iv) synthetic systems or intumescent, agent system, (v) dry chemical powder system, (vi) in cab in and valvetested CO2 system, (vii) fine water particle aerosol type systems (combustion generated aerosol). It also includes preparation of national strategy for halon phase out. To be undertaken at the Defense Institute of Fire Research, Delhi.  
**Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Consumption ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Date Approved**: Jul-94  
**Date of Completion**: Jun-99  
**Funds Disbursed**: 309,000  
**Approved Cost-Effectiveness**: 2.57

### India IND/HAL/18/INV/60

**Type**: Extinguisher Conversion from halon-1211 to ABC dry chemical powder (ABC-DCP) and carbon dioxide (CO2) in portable extinguishers at Real Value Appliances Ltd.  
**Project Description**: Installation of equipment for the ABC-DCP filling line and CO2 lines; valve manufacturing plant, CO2 storage tank, miscellaneous equipment for ABC-DCP and CO2 lines. Selected equipment component will be manufactured in-house to meet the Indian Standards. Implemented under the retroactive reimbursement modality.  
**Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out**: 462.0  
**Consumption ODP Phased Out**: 462.0  
**Production ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Date Approved**: Nov-95  
**Date of Completion**: Dec-03  
**Funds Disbursed**: 251,736  
**Approved Cost-Effectiveness**: 0.54

### India IND/HAL/24/INV/163

**Type**: Extinguisher Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Steelage Industries Limited Minimax Division/ Chennai  
**Project Description**: Installation of ABC dry chemical powder and CO2 filling equipment, storage tanks and piping; provision of a halon 1211/1301 reclamation equipment to be provided in the event of recovery of 1301 halon for servicing existing systems; technology transfer and license agreement fee and certification. Approved under the condition that the conversion to CO2 should be maintained, at the ratio specified, after implementation, or the operating costs associated with CO2 should be reduced and any negligible costs retained. The project should be undertaken within the context of the sector strategy prepared by UNDP, and the strategy should be submitted to the Executive Committee. Project implementation should not go forward until a list of equipment to be destroyed is made available by the enterprise and the dismantling or destruction will be carried out.  
**Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out**: 116.0  
**Consumption ODP Phased Out**: 116.0  
**Production ODP To Be Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Production ODP Phased Out**: 0.0  
**Date Approved**: May-00  
**Date of Completion**: Jan-02  
**Funds Disbursed**: 131,915  
**Approved Cost-Effectiveness**: 1.14

*According to the 2002 Progress Reports  
Source: Inventory and Progress Reports
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>UNDP</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Subsector</th>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>ExCom Provision</th>
<th>Consumption ODP Total</th>
<th>Consumption ODP Planned</th>
<th>Production ODP Total</th>
<th>Production ODP Planned</th>
<th>Date Approved</th>
<th>Revised Approved Date of Completion</th>
<th>Date Completed</th>
<th>Flushed Date of Completion for Ongoing Projects</th>
<th>Original Approved Funds</th>
<th>Total Funds Disbursed</th>
<th>Approved Cost Effectiveness</th>
<th>PCR</th>
<th>Rejected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL/24/INV/105</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vimal Industrial Safety Equipment Corporation Ltd., Baroda, Gujrat</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vimal Industrial Safety Equipment Corporation Ltd., Baroda, Gujrat</td>
<td>292.0</td>
<td>292.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May 98</td>
<td>April 00</td>
<td>Dec-98</td>
<td>219,152</td>
<td>219,152</td>
<td>120,191</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL/24/INV/106</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at New Age Industries, Bombay</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at New Age Industries, Bombay</td>
<td>212.0</td>
<td>212.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May 98</td>
<td>April 00</td>
<td>Dec-98</td>
<td>165,269</td>
<td>165,269</td>
<td>155,241</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL/24/INV/107</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Atkins, New Delhi</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Atkins, New Delhi</td>
<td>352.0</td>
<td>352.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May 00</td>
<td>April 00</td>
<td>May-00</td>
<td>14,750</td>
<td>56,850</td>
<td>24,720</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL/24/INV/108</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vijay Fire Protection Systems Ltd., Bombay</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vijay Fire Protection Systems Ltd., Bombay</td>
<td>130.0</td>
<td>130.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May 00</td>
<td>April 00</td>
<td>Dec-98</td>
<td>121,249</td>
<td>121,979</td>
<td>131,935</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL/24/INV/109</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vimal Industrial Safety Equipment Corporation Ltd., Baroda, Gujrat</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production and elimination of its consumption of virgin halon-1301 at Vimal Industrial Safety Equipment Corporation Ltd., Baroda, Gujrat</td>
<td>130.0</td>
<td>130.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May 00</td>
<td>April 00</td>
<td>Dec-98</td>
<td>121,172</td>
<td>121,172</td>
<td>188,172</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*According to the 2002 Progress Reports*  
Source: Inventory and Progress Reports
**Details of Halon Projects in Article 5 Countries Visited**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Subsector</th>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>ExCom Provision</th>
<th>Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out</th>
<th>Production ODP To Be Phased Out</th>
<th>Production ODP Phased Out*</th>
<th>Date Approved</th>
<th>Approved Date of Completion</th>
<th>Revised Approved Date of Completion for Implementation Delays*</th>
<th>Date Completed *</th>
<th>Planned Date of Completion for Ongoing Projects</th>
<th>Original Approved Funds</th>
<th>Total Funds Approved including Adjustments</th>
<th>Funds Disbursed*</th>
<th>Approved Cost Effectiveness</th>
<th>P&amp;R Reserved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/177</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of ABC dry chemical powder and CO2 filling equipment, storage tanks and piping, provision of a halon 1211/1301 reclamation equipment to be provided in the request by 1,301 halon for servicing existing systems, technology transfer and license arrangements and certification.</td>
<td>Approved under the condition that the conversion to CO2 should be maintained, at the rates specified, after implementation, or the operating costs associated with CO2 should be calculated and any negligible costs retained. The project is intended to be within the context of the sector strategy prepared by UNDP, and the strategy should be submitted to the Executive Committee.</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Dec-99</td>
<td>50.320</td>
<td>50.320</td>
<td>50.320</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/186</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of a self contained filling machine for ABC powder (scales, air line coiled, vacuum system, tank detector), a manually-operated portable extinguisher CO2 filling equipment (pumps, scales), modification of welding equipment and testing certification.</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>54.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Dec-99</td>
<td>79.540</td>
<td>79.540</td>
<td>79.540</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/196</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of a self contained filling machine for ABC powder (scales, air line coiled, vacuum system, tank detector), a manually-operated portable extinguisher CO2 filling equipment (pumps, scales), modification of welding equipment and testing certification.</td>
<td>36.0</td>
<td>36.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Dec-99</td>
<td>53.280</td>
<td>49.971</td>
<td>49.971</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/206</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of a self contained filling machine for ABC powder (scales, air line coiled, vacuum system, tank detector), a manually-operated portable extinguisher CO2 filling equipment (pumps, scales), modification of welding equipment and testing certification.</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Dec-99</td>
<td>82.000</td>
<td>68.916</td>
<td>68.916</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/216</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of a self contained filling machine for ABC powder (scales, air line coiled, vacuum system, tank detector), a manually-operated portable extinguisher CO2 filling equipment (pumps, scales), modification of welding equipment and testing certification.</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>May-97</td>
<td>37.340</td>
<td>37.340</td>
<td>37.340</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND/HAL24/INV/226</td>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher</td>
<td>Conversion of halon-1211 fire extinguisher production to ABC powder and CO2 units</td>
<td>Installation of a self contained filling machine for ABC powder (scales, air line coiled, vacuum system, tank detector), a manually-operated portable extinguisher CO2 filling equipment (pumps, scales), modification of welding equipment and testing certification.</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-96</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>Dec-99</td>
<td>130.000</td>
<td>130.000</td>
<td>130.000</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*According to the 2002 Progress Reports
Source: Inventory and Progress Reports
Page 3 of 7
## Annex IV

### Details of Halon Projects in Article 5 Countries Visited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Subsector</th>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>ExCom Provision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Banking</td>
<td>National halon management and banking programme</td>
<td>It will include the establishment of a halon critical users database; establishment of a halon management group/advisory forum; establishment of a national halon banking operation; technical training for halon bank operators and major halon assets; development of public and technical personnel education and awareness activities; development of possible regional halon management and banking participation. The creation of a database will assist with the identification of systems in various segments and would significantly contribute to follow-up planning for amounts required to be retained for nonessential uses within a potential halon banking structure. Detailed inventory of the halon stocks will include quantities, size and instalations specifications, together with the magnitude and estimated quality of halon stocks, could also simplify the overall logistical controls. Jointly implemented with Canada.</td>
<td>Disbursement would not take place until a commitment had been given by the Government that regulations facilitating the ban on the production and import of new halons would be established within six months after the reclamation center had been set up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>IND</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Banking</td>
<td>National halon management and banking programme</td>
<td>It will include the establishment of a halon critical users database; establishment of a halon management group/advisory forum; establishment of a national halon banking operation; technical training for halon bank operators and major halon assets; development of public and technical personnel education and awareness activities; development of possible regional halon management and banking participation. The creation of a database will assist with the identification of systems in various segments and would significantly contribute to follow-up planning for amounts required to be retained for nonessential uses within a potential halon banking structure. Detailed inventory of the halon stocks will include quantities, size and instalations specifications, together with the magnitude and estimated quality of halon stocks, could also simplify the overall logistical controls. Jointly implemented with Canada.</td>
<td>Disbursement would not take place until a commitment had been given by the Government that regulations facilitating the ban on the production and import of new halons would be established within six months after the reclamation center had been set up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>MYS</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Banking</td>
<td>National halon management and banking programme</td>
<td>Implementation of the immediate, complex and permanent phase-out of production of halons and the complete phase-out of consumption of virgin halons. Panels will be disbursed by the Bank to the government once the halon production plants are dismantled and have been certified. This is the total funding that would be available to the Government from the fund for the cessation of production of Annex A Group II halons and all existing and future halons classified as controlled substances as per the Montreal Protocol phase-out schedule and dismantling of the production plants, which will be completed not later than 12 months after approval of this agreement. With regard to the consumption sector, five enterprises have already been identified and included within the total of the approved funding. Consumption of these five enterprises, as well as any other remaining halon consumption in the country, will be eliminated within the level of trials provided. The Government agrees to ensure accurate monitoring of the phase-out in the production and consumption sector, to report regularly to the management committee, and to ensure full compliance with the schedule provided.</td>
<td>359.0 0.0 321.0 0.0 74-01 Aug-02 Oct-02 2,600,000 2,000,000 0 4.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>MYS</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Banking</td>
<td>National halon management and banking programme</td>
<td>Establishment of several maintenance and recovery centres at all major fire stations, a central halon reclamation plant, a training programme for 100 core trainers and 500 technicians, and procurement of 50 halon recycling machines.</td>
<td>0.0 0.0 0.0 Feb-92 Feb-93 Jun-97 Sep-98 720,000 718,850 718,850 0.8 x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>MYS</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Extinguisher Converson of production of portable fire extinguishers at Eversafe</td>
<td>Installation of a ABC powder filling equipment with unload equipment and storage tank, filling line and leak detection system, a CO2 filling line with a recovery unit for halon 1211 for filling of existing fire extinguishers, trials, technical assistance and training. This project represents the phaseout of the halon fire extinguisher sub-sector in the country.</td>
<td>574.0 574.0 74-01 Nov-90 Nov-90 Oct-90 179,784 178,372 178,372 0.31 X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>VEN</td>
<td>ONG</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>INV</td>
<td>HAL</td>
<td>Technical assistance</td>
<td>Workshops for the recycling and banking of halons</td>
<td>Workshops delivered to enterprises and users of halon protection systems, aimed at introducing halons recycling practices, establishment of halon banks and elimination of halons in both portable equipment and fixed new installations.</td>
<td>0.0 0.0 0.0 Mar-98 Mar-98 Jan-99 24,000 24,000 24,000 X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*According to the 2002 Progress Reports
Source: Inventory and Progress Reports
### Details of Halon Projects in Article 5 Countries Visited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Subsector</th>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Project Description</th>
<th>ExCom Provision</th>
<th>Consumption ODP To Be Phased Out</th>
<th>Production ODP Phased Out</th>
<th>Production ODP Phased Out*</th>
<th>Date Approved</th>
<th>Revised Approved Date of Completion for Implementation Delays*</th>
<th>Date Completed</th>
<th>Planned Date of Completion for Ongoing Projects*</th>
<th>Original Approved Funds</th>
<th>Total Funds Approved including Adjustments</th>
<th>Funds Disbursed*</th>
<th>Approval Cost-Effectiveness</th>
<th>PCR Residual</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>VEN/HAL/11/TAS/18</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>FIN</td>
<td>TAS</td>
<td>Technical assistance/support</td>
<td>Technical assistance in halon sector Assessment of halon 1301 needs, halon management programme development, halon 1301 recycling equipment, halon sector study tour, and a workshop ($109,500 used for other bilateral cooperation).</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Nov-93</td>
<td>Nov-93</td>
<td>Jan-96</td>
<td>May-96</td>
<td>414,000</td>
<td>283,356</td>
<td>304,500</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>VEN/HAL/13/DEM/27</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>FIN</td>
<td>DEM</td>
<td>Technical assistance/support</td>
<td>Technical assistance in halon-1211 management Assistance in the development of a halon 1211 management programme, including halon assessment, halon recycling and baking, and delivery of one UNDP-procured halon 1211 recovery and charging unit.</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>Jul-94</td>
<td>Jul-95</td>
<td>Jul-95</td>
<td>371,000</td>
<td>34,000</td>
<td>34,000</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>VEN/HAL/19/TAS/47</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>FIN</td>
<td>TAS</td>
<td>Technical assistance/support</td>
<td>Halon recycling and bank management (Phase II) Continue to support the establishment of a halon bank clearinghouse, provision of halon 1301 and halon 1211 recycling and reclamation equipment and laboratory analysis equipment, and follow-up technology transfer and mentor. Fondos intenta prove the recycling and reclamation facility and financiating financially self-supporting, by charging a recycling fee to cover operating costs (amount would be used to offset operating costs), and will also make the services provided by the recycling facility to users in other countries in the region, via a commercial basis.</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>May-96</td>
<td>May-96</td>
<td>Nov-96</td>
<td>May-96</td>
<td>352,204</td>
<td>283,356</td>
<td>285,598</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>