



# 联合国 环境规划署

Distr.  
GENERAL

UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/97/9  
7 November 2025

CHINESE  
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

执行蒙特利尔议定书  
多边基金执行委员会  
第九十七次会议  
2025 年 12 月 1 日至 5 日，蒙特利尔  
临时议程<sup>1</sup> 项目 6(a)

## 根据 2024 年业务计划评估执行机构的绩效

### 背景

#### 1. 本文件由以下各节组成：

- 一. 定量绩效指标分析。本节对执行机构在 2024 年业务计划<sup>2</sup>设定的绩效目标以及提交给第 97 次会议的进展和财务报告方面的绩效进行了定量评估；以及对八个绩效指标中的每一个进行趋势分析。
- 二. 定性绩效指标分析。本节根据国家臭氧机构官员提供的投入，对双边和执行机构的绩效进行了定性评估。
- 三. 秘书处的评论
- 四. 建议

<sup>1</sup> UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/97/1

<sup>2</sup> 根据第 41/93 号决定通过并经第 47/51 号和第 71/28 号决定修订的绩效指标，以及第 93 次会议报告（UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/93/105）附件 X – XIII 中为 2024 年业务计划通过的目标。

一. 定量绩效指标分析

2. 表 1 列出了批准的目标、实现每个目标的进展衡量标准以及实现的目标数量。

表 1. 2024 年绩效指标目标和实现情况

| 条目          | 开发计划署    |       |       |      | 环境规划署  |        |        |      | 工发组织            |       |        |      | 世界银行    |         |         |      |
|-------------|----------|-------|-------|------|--------|--------|--------|------|-----------------|-------|--------|------|---------|---------|---------|------|
|             | 目标       | 机构实现  | 秘书处评估 | 达到目标 | 目标     | 机构实现   | 秘书处评估  | 达到目标 | 目标              | 机构实现  | 秘书处评估  | 达到目标 | 目标      | 机构实现    | 秘书处评估   | 达到目标 |
| 批准的付款*      | 38       | 30    | 30    | 否    | 86     | 63     | 76     | 否    | 43              | 37    | 36     | 否    | 4       | 2       | 2       | 否    |
| 批准的项目/活动    | 33       | 29    | 29    | 否    | 119    | 153    | 122    | 是    | 56              | 18    | 40     | 否    | 4       | 4       | 4       | 是    |
| 支付的资金（百万美元） | 26.75    | 18.74 | 18.74 | 否    | 24.72  | 24.01  | 23.78  | 否    | 19.68           | 19.79 | 19.79  | 是    | 18.16   | 26.41   | 26.41   | 是    |
| 淘汰消耗臭氧层物质*  | 271.84   | 260.0 | 260.0 | 否    | 198.99 | 177.7  | 173.8  | 否    | 468.43          | 456.7 | 456.7  | 否    | 5,446.1 | 7,876.9 | 5,443.7 | 否    |
| 活动的项目完成情况   | 45       | 41    | 41    | 否    | 81     | 82     | 82     | 是    | 64              | 34    | 33     | 否    | 1       | 6       | 6       | 是    |
| 财务完成速度      | 70% (48) | 48    | 48    | 是    | 12 个月  | 5.8个月  | 5.9个月  | 是    | 完成运营后的<br>12 个月 | 12个月  | 11.6个月 | 是    | 90% (7) | 57% (4) | 57% (4) | 否    |
| 及时提交项目完成报告  | 准时(1)    | 准时(6) | 准时(2) | 是    | 准时(5)  | 准时(11) | 准时(11) | 是    | 准时(4)           | 准时    | 准时(6)  | 是    | 0       | 0       | 0       | 不适用  |
| 及时提交进度报告    | 准时       | 准时    | 准时    | 是    | 准时     | 准时     | 准时     | 是    | 准时              | 准时    | 准时     | 是    | 准时      | 准时      | 准时      | 是    |
| 实现的目标数      |          |       |       | 3/8  |        |        |        | 5/8  |                 |       |        | 4/8  |         |         |         | 4/7  |

\* “如果一个机构因另一个合作机构或牵头机构而无法提交付款”或“如果提交执行委员会审议的含氢氯氟烃淘汰管理计划因国家臭氧机构和机构无法控制的因素而未获批准”，该机构的目标将被降低。

绩效加权评估

3. 表 2 按秘书处的方法，按绩效指标列出 2024 年加权评估的结果。

表 2. 2024 年执行机构绩效的加权评估

| 条目         | 权重  | 开发计划署      |    | 环境规划署      |    | 工发组织       |    | 世界银行        |     |
|------------|-----|------------|----|------------|----|------------|----|-------------|-----|
|            |     | 实现的<br>目标% | 积分 | 实现的<br>目标% | 积分 | 实现的<br>目标% | 积分 | 实现的<br>目标%* | 积分  |
| 批准的付款      | 10  | 79         | 8  | 88         | 9  | 84         | 8  | 50          | 5   |
| 批准的项目/活动   | 10  | 88         | 9  | 103        | 10 | 71         | 7  | 100         | 10  |
| 支付的资金      | 15  | 70         | 11 | 96         | 14 | 101        | 15 | 145         | 15  |
| 淘汰消耗臭氧层物质  | 25  | 96         | 24 | 87         | 22 | 97         | 24 | 100         | 25  |
| 活动项目完成情况   | 20  | 91         | 18 | 101        | 20 | 52         | 10 | 600         | 20  |
| 财务完成速度     | 10  | 100        | 10 | 151        | 10 | 103        | 10 | 57          | 7   |
| 及时提交项目完成报告 | 5   | 200        | 5  | 220        | 5  | 150        | 5  | 不适用         | 不适用 |
| 及时提交进度报告   | 5   | 100        | 5  | 100        | 5  | 100        | 5  | 100         | 7   |
| 2024 年评估   | 100 |            | 90 |            | 95 |            | 84 |             | 89  |

\*对于世界银行来说，“及时提交项目完成报告”的权重（5）已按比例分配给其他行政指标：“财务完成速度（3）”和“及时提交进度报告（2）”。获得的积分四舍五入到最接近的数字。

其它定量绩效指标分析

4. 根据第 41/93 号决定，<sup>3</sup> 附件一和附件二分别介绍了投资<sup>4</sup> 项目和非投资<sup>5</sup> 项目的历史分析。

5. 附件一显示，所有机构在 2024 年实现了淘汰消耗臭氧层物质的目标。开发计划署和世界银行实现了支付资金数额的目标，而工发组织实现了 98%。开发计划署和工发组织实现了项目完成报告的目标，而世界银行没有 2024 年应提交的项目完成报告。2024 年的交付速度和首次支付与前几年相似，反映了所有执行机构的历史表现。与 2023 年相比，开发计划署和工发组织的批准项目价值目标实现率有所提高，而世界银行的实现率有所下降。世界银行实现了淘汰消耗臭氧层物质的目标，开发计划署和工发组织也部分实现了这一目标。由于氟氯化碳和含氢氯氟烃的消耗臭氧潜能值存在差异，以及批准多年期协定而不是单个项目，“成本效益”和“项目筹备费用”指标对于任何趋势都没有定论。

6. 附件二显示，开发计划署、环境规划署和工发组织实现了支付资金数额的目标；2024 年所有执行机构的交付速度和首次支付速度与前几年相似。

二. 定性绩效指标分析

7. 共处理了从 93 个第 5 条国家的国家臭氧机构收到的 160<sup>6</sup> 份问卷，以评估双边和执行机构的定性绩效。

<sup>3</sup> 请求秘书处在今后评价执行机构业绩时，根据趋势分析继续监测投资和非投资业绩指标。

<sup>4</sup> 投资项目包括由项目代码指定的多年期协定。

<sup>5</sup> 只有“资金支付”、“首次支付速度”和“项目完成速度”指标适用于非投资项目。

<sup>6</sup> 澳大利亚（1）、法国（1）、德国（8）、开发计划署（30）、环境规划署（73）、工发组织（44）和世界银行（3）。

8. 调查表包含三大类问题，必须对各机构在每一类中的绩效进行全面评估。

9. 表 3 概述了国家臭氧机构对三大类别的总体评级。应该指出的是，一些国家臭氧机构没有提供一个或多个类别的总体评级，尽管它们确实对本文件附件三所列的个别问题做出了答复。表 3 显示，大多数总体评级是满意或以上；只有 13 个评级低于满意。

表 3. 按类别分列的双边和执行机构定性绩效总体评级

| 类别      | 高度满意 | 满意 | 不太满意 | 不满意 |
|---------|------|----|------|-----|
| 影响      | 91   | 37 | 4    | 1   |
| 组织与合作   | 73   | 31 | 3    | 1   |
| 技术援助/培训 | 78   | 41 | 2    | 2   |

10. 除了对上述三个主要类别要求的总体评分外，调查表还包括 31 个单独的问题。国家臭氧机构对这些问题给出了 118 个低于满意的评级，详见附件三。

### 三. 秘书处的评论

11. 已向各执行机构通报了 2024 年绩效定量评估的结果，结果显示，所有执行机构都实现了 84%或更多的目标。

12. 敬请执行委员会注意，与 2023 年相比，两个执行机构（开发计划署和环境规划署）2024 年的绩效定量评估有所改善。

13. 秘书处注意到，93 个国家臭氧机构（2023 年为 88 个）提交了定性评估。秘书处将从国家臭氧机构收到的评估发送给各自的双边和执行机构征求意见，重点是 131 个低于满意的评级（包括三大类别的 13 个低评级和个别问题的 118 个低评级）。

14. 对于在定性评估中发现问题的所有国家（即“不太满意”或“不满意”的评级），各国家臭氧机构与双边和执行机构之间的对话已经完成；所有机构都报告说，在与各自国家臭氧机构的对话中商定了前进的道路，在大多数情况下，他们能够解决与不太满意的评级有关的问题。在这方面，敬请执行委员会赞赏地注意到，双边和执行机构努力与各自的国家臭氧机构就其服务被认为不太满意的领域进行公开和建设性的讨论，与有关国家臭氧机构的协商结果也令人满意。

### 四. 建议

15. 敬请执行委员会：

(a) 注意：

(一) 根据文件 UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/97/9 所载的 2024 年业务计划对执行机构的绩效进行评估；

(二) 所有执行机构对其 2024 年的绩效进行了定量评估，在 100 分制中至少为 84 分；

- (三) 这一趋势分析表明，与 2023 年相比，2024 年执行机构的某些指标的绩效没有改善；
  - (四) 与 2023 年相比，两个执行机构（开发计划署和环境规划署）2024 年的定量绩效有所改善；
  - (五) 赞赏地注意到，双边和执行机构努力与各自的国家臭氧机构就其服务被认为不太令人满意的领域进行公开和建设性的讨论，与有关国家臭氧机构的协商结果也令人满意；和
- (b) 鼓励国家臭氧机构每年及时提交对协助其政府的双边和执行机构定性绩效的评估，注意到 144 个国家中有 93 个国家提交了 2024 年的评估，而 2023 年为 88 个。

**Annex I**  
**INVESTMENT PROJECT PERFORMANCE BY AGENCY**  
**(2001-2024)**

| <b>UNDP</b>                                  | <b>2001</b> | <b>2002</b> | <b>2003</b> | <b>2004</b> | <b>2005</b> | <b>2006</b> | <b>2007</b> | <b>2008</b> | <b>2009</b> | <b>2010</b> | <b>2011</b> | <b>2012</b> | <b>2013</b> | <b>2014</b> | <b>2015</b> | <b>2016</b> | <b>2017</b> | <b>2018</b> | <b>2019</b> | <b>2020</b> | <b>2021</b> | <b>2022</b> | <b>2023</b> | <b>2024</b> |
|----------------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| ODS phased out                               | 99%         | 92%         | 100%        | 79%         | 91%         | 85%         | 100%        | 86%         | 100%        | N/A         | 0%          | 94%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 0%          | 34%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 37%         | 100%        |
| Funds disbursed                              | 95%         | 77%         | 64%         | 100%        | 96%         | 66%         | 76%         | 98%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 97%         | 97%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 64%         | 100%        |
| Project completion reports                   | 86%         | 87%         | 100%        | 97%         | 79%         | 30%         | 82%         | 74%         | 100%        | 54%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        |
| Distribution among countries                 | 63%         | 58%         | 38%         | 72%         | 44%         | 75%         | 64%         | 66%         | 83%         | 51%         | 79%         | 94%         | 81%         | 68%         | 85%         | 90%         | 60%         | 88%         | 80%         | 69%         | 76%         | 67%         | 77%         | 82%         |
| Value of projects approved                   | 100%        | 99%         | 65%         | 73%         | 82%         | 83%         | 77%         | 100%        | 100%        | 38%         | 87%         | 100%        | 87%         | 89%         | 91%         | 100%        | 80%         | 79%         | 85%         | 81%         | 80%         | 78%         | 57%         | 84%         |
| ODS to be phased out                         | 96%         | 77%         | 44%         | 89%         | 70%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 92%         | 61%         | 100%        | 29%         | 83%         | 84%         | 84%         | 96%         | 97%         | 93%         | 95%         | 98%         | 82%         | 96%         |
|                                              |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |
| Cost of project preparation (% of approvals) | 1.1%        | 2.5%        | 1.6%        | 3.6%        | 1.4%        | 0.5%        | 3.6%        | 1.5%        | 14.7%       | 14.4%       | 3.0%        | 2.8%        | 1.8%        | 0.2%        | 4.3%        | 2.3%        | 2.71%       | 0.99%       | 0.43%       | 0.74%       | 1.46%       | 6.42%       | 5.76%       | 5.18%       |
| Cost-effectiveness (\$/kg)                   | 8.3         | 10.35       | 7.1         | 6.27        | 8.24        | 4.99        | 5.76        | 5.61        | 6.09        | 59.84       | 146.85      | 92.53       | 56.92       | 249.68      | 70.89       | 108.35      | 184.95      | 38.00       | 45.41       | 51.97       | 51.22       | 59.08       | 14.18       | 16.46       |
| Speed of first disbursement (months)         | 12.84       | 12.8        | 12.8        | 12.91       | 12.9        | 13.0        | 13.1        | 13.2        | 13.4        | 13.6        | 13.7        | 13.7        | 13.7        | 13.7        | 13.7        | 13.6        | 13.5        | 13.6        | 13.6        | 13.6        | 13.6        | 13.6        | 13.7        | 13.7        |
| Speed of completion (months)                 | 33.6        | 32.7        | 32.4        | 32.41       | 32.9        | 33.6        | 33.9        | 33.8        | 33.9        | 34.2        | 34.6        | 34.9        | 34.9        | 35.2        | 35.1        | 34.4        | 35.6        | 35.7        | 35.8        | 35.7        | 35.8        | 35.9        | 35.8        | 35.9        |
| Net emissions due to delays (ODP tonnes)     | 11,727      | 9,023       | 6,466       | 3,607       | 4,538       | 6,619       | 2,674       | 1,312       | 92          | 113         | 101         | 520         | 538         | 248         | 238         | -881        | 416.3       | 499.6       | 426.1       | 395.9       | 268.4       | 335.3       | 480.9       | 651.7       |
|                                              |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |
| <b>UNIDO</b>                                 | <b>2001</b> | <b>2002</b> | <b>2003</b> | <b>2004</b> | <b>2005</b> | <b>2006</b> | <b>2007</b> | <b>2008</b> | <b>2009</b> | <b>2010</b> | <b>2011</b> | <b>2012</b> | <b>2013</b> | <b>2014</b> | <b>2015</b> | <b>2016</b> | <b>2017</b> | <b>2018</b> | <b>2019</b> | <b>2020</b> | <b>2021</b> | <b>2022</b> | <b>2023</b> | <b>2024</b> |
| ODS phased out                               | 100%        | 100%        | 88%         | 100%        | 99%         | 100%        | 100%        | 84%         | 86%         | 100%        | 100%        | 0%          | 27%         | 42%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 50%         | 45%         | 55%         | 87%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        |
| Funds disbursed                              | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 91%         | 100%        | 94%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 97%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 69%         | 86%         | 87%         | 100%        | 100%        | 98%         |
| Project completion reports                   | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 84%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        |
| Distribution among countries                 | 89%         | 73%         | 78%         | 67%         | 79%         | 69%         | 75%         | 82%         | 61%         | 81%         | 83%         | 100%        | 72%         | 67%         | 100%        | 76%         | 54%         | 64%         | 75%         | 74%         | 52%         | 62%         | 66%         | 75%         |
| Value of projects approved                   | 99%         | 97%         | 68%         | 82%         | 100%        | 100%        | 92%         | 100%        | 59%         | 78%         | 100%        | 79%         | 88%         | 64%         | 93%         | 71%         | 73%         | 57%         | 73%         | 85%         | 52%         | 90%         | 77%         | 100%        |
| ODS to be phased out                         | 100%        | 100%        | 37%         | 89%         | 100%        | 47%         | 91%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 36%         | 81%         | 21%         | 36%         | 100%        | 82%         | 61%         | 71%         | 82%         | 86%         | 84%         | 70%         | 96%         | 97%         |
|                                              |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |

UNEP/OzL.Pro/ExCom/97/9  
Annex I

|                                              | 2001        | 2002        | 2003        | 2004        | 2005        | 2006        | 2007        | 2008        | 2009        | 2010        | 2011        | 2012        | 2013        | 2014        | 2015        | 2016        | 2017        | 2018        | 2019        | 2020        | 2021        | 2022        | 2023        | 2024        |
|----------------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Cost of project preparation (% of approvals) | 2.7%        | 3.3%        | 3.6%        | 2%          | 0.9%        | 1.8%        | 2.1%        | 1.3%        | 11.9%       | 5.7%        | 2.7%        | 3.9%        | 1.1%        | 1.3%        | 1.8%        | 3.6%        | 2.6%        | 0.4%        | 2.4%        | 2.8%        | 3.2%        | 8.71%       | 8.82%       | 4.50%       |
| Cost-effectiveness (\$/kg)                   | 5.67        | 7.28        | 9.79        | 3.58        | 3.10        | 7.13        | 6.51        | 9.34        | 3.26        | 22.58       | 187.59      | 35.34       | 186.02      | 79.01       | 56.02       | 65.50       | 53.61       | 22.83       | 119.38      | 20.96       | 27.80       | 17.48       | 11.09       | 11.19       |
| Speed of first disbursement (months)         | 9.29        | 9.16        | 9.2         | 9.06        | 8.97        | 9.0         | 8.9         | 8.7         | 8.7         | 8.7         | 8.4         | 8.6         | 8.5         | 8.6         | 9.0         | 8.9         | 9.0         | 9.2         | 9.2         | 9.2         | 9.1         | 9.3         | 9.3         | 9.2         |
| Speed of completion (months)                 | 29.85       | 30.89       | 31.7        | 32.35       | 32.98       | 33.2        | 33.5        | 33.4        | 33.7        | 34.1        | 35.0        | 35.9        | 36.8        | 38.3        | 39.5        | 40.2        | 40.9        | 41.1        | 41.7        | 42.4        | 42.7        | 42.4        | 42.1        | 42.5        |
| Net emissions due to delays (ODP tonnes)     | 5,727       | 5,960       | 3,503       | 13,035      | 1,481       | 3,864       | 4,470       | 3,431       | 6,970       | 8,918       | 14,583      | 17,144      | 8,805       | 9,939       | 13,389      | 6,906       | 8,054.8     | 7,971.7     | 3,372.1     | 8,137.3     | 9,458.7     | 8,112.8     | 7,797.6     | 870.5       |
|                                              |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |
| <b>World Bank</b>                            | <b>2001</b> | <b>2002</b> | <b>2003</b> | <b>2004</b> | <b>2005</b> | <b>2006</b> | <b>2007</b> | <b>2008</b> | <b>2009</b> | <b>2010</b> | <b>2011</b> | <b>2012</b> | <b>2013</b> | <b>2014</b> | <b>2015</b> | <b>2016</b> | <b>2017</b> | <b>2018</b> | <b>2019</b> | <b>2020</b> | <b>2021</b> | <b>2022</b> | <b>2023</b> | <b>2024</b> |
| ODS phased out                               | 100%        | 100%        | 84%         | 100%        | 69%         | 31%         | 84%         | 47%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 20%         | 98%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 51%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | N/A         | 66%         | 100%        |
| Funds disbursed                              | 74%         | 100%        | 100%        | 73%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 73%         | 64%         | 43%         | 15%         | 100%        | 100%        | 100%        | 78%         | 96%         | 62%         | 80%         | 70%         | 63%         | 99%         | 43%         | 100%        |
| Project completion reports                   | 74%         | 100%        | 84%         | 84%         | 100%        | 84%         | 74%         | 69%         | 25%         | 20%         | 85%         | 10%         | 100%        | 24%         | 24%         | 8%          | 33%         | 11%         | 45%         | 26%         | 77%         | 90%         | 100%        | N/A         |
| Distribution among countries                 | 67%         | 79%         | 65%         | 71%         | 93%         | 79%         | 92%         | 77%         | 67%         | 50%         | 57%         | 100%        | 67%         | 50%         | 33%         | 100%        | 50%         | 60%         | 100%        | 33%         | 60%         | 75%         | 100%        | 40%         |
| Value of projects approved                   | 92%         | 100%        | 82%         | 94%         | 83%         | 87%         | 83%         | 93%         | 98%         | 3%          | 93%         | 29%         | 93%         | 72%         | 100%        | 39%         | 29%         | 95%         | 46%         | 26%         | 77%         | 80%         | 100%        | 90%         |
| ODS to be phased out                         | 72%         | 91%         | 65%         | 59%         | 100%        | 66%         | 93%         | 35%         | 100%        | 89%         | 11%         | 7%          | 25%         | 11%         | 100%        | 50%         | 74%         | 69%         | 100%        | 84%         | 95%         | 99%         | 100%        | 100%        |
|                                              |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |             |
| Cost of project preparation (% of approvals) | 1.3%        | 0.4%        | 0.6%        | 0.2%        | 0.4%        | 0.4%        | 0.02%       | 0.6%        | 2.2%        | 74.8%       | 1.5%        | 5.6%        | 0.2%        | 0.6%        | 0.4%        | 4.0%        | 18.64%      | 1.04%       | 0.0%        | 0.0%        | 0.0%        | 0.61%       | 2.92%       | 0.81%       |
| Cost-effectiveness (\$/kg)                   | 3.85        | 4.57        | 6.12        | 3.74        | 1.04        | 3.33        | 3.29        | 9.36        | 1.43        | 1.12        | 545.23      | 69.01       | 118.26      | 214.04      | 19.84       | 48.54       | 52.66       | 618.83      | 177.65      | 2.56        | 4.55        | 3.85        | 18.29       | 31.96       |
| Speed of first disbursement (months)         | 25.33       | 26.28       | 26          | 26.02       | 25.7        | 25.3        | 25.0        | 24.8        | 24.8        | 24.6        | 24.6        | 24.7        | 24.6        | 24.6        | 24.6        | 24.6        | 24.5        | 24.4        | 24.5        | 24.4        | 24.4        | 24.4        | 24.3        | 24.2        |
| Speed of completion (months)                 | 40.09       | 41.35       | 41          | 40.88       | 40.7        | 40.3        | 40.2        | 39.8        | 39.8        | 40.2        | 40.2        | 40.2        | 40.3        | 40.8        | 40.8        | 40.8        | 41.0        | 40.1        | 41.2        | 41.2        | 41.2        | 41.3        | 41.2        | 41.2        |
| Net emissions due to delays (ODP tonnes)     | 21,539      | 22,324      | 18,021      | 8,338       | 4,843       | 5,674       | 2,316       | 1,303       | 182         | 1,680       | 801         | 901         | 901         | 1,002       | 275         | 455         | 249.9       | 788.4       | 812.98      | 5.5         | 74.8        | 149.5       | 146.9       | 65.5        |

Annex II

NON-INVESTMENT PROJECT PERFORMANCE BY AGENCY  
(2001-2024)

| UNDP                                    | 2001  | 2002  | 2003 | 2004  | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 |
|-----------------------------------------|-------|-------|------|-------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| Funds disbursed                         | 93%   | 61%   | 100% | 100%  | 100% | 92%  | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 84%  | 88%  | 100% | 47%  | 82%  | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| Speed until first disbursement (months) | 12    | 11.4  | 11   | 11.44 | 11.5 | 11.8 | 11.7 | 11.7 | 11.8 | 12.2 | 11.8 | 11.9 | 11.9 | 11.8 | 12.0 | 11.9 | 11.8 | 11.7 | 11.8 | 11.7 | 11.7 | 11.7 | 11.6 | 11.5 |
| Speed until project completion (months) | 36    | 34.7  | 35   | 35.36 | 35.4 | 36.6 | 37.3 | 37.1 | 37.3 | 37.7 | 37.1 | 37.4 | 37.2 | 36.7 | 36.3 | 36.0 | 36.8 | 36.2 | 36.1 | 36.0 | 36.0 | 35.7 | 35.7 | 35.6 |
|                                         |       |       |      |       |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| UNEP                                    | 2001  | 2002  | 2003 | 2004  | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 |
| Funds disbursed                         | 93%   | 93%   | 99%  | 54%   | 54%  | 51%  | 49%  | 64%  | 69%  | 60%  | 63%  | 55%  | 47%  | 61%  | 44%  | 91%  | 100% | 81%  | 85%  | 75%  | 85%  | 85%  | 82%  | 100% |
| Speed until first disbursement (months) | 6.87  | 7.3   | 7.6  | 8.49  | 8.4  | 8.4  | 8.7  | 9.0  | 9.0  | 9.5  | 9.6  | 9.8  | 9.8  | 9.9  | 10.1 | 10.5 | 10.5 | 10.9 | 10.9 | 11.1 | 11.6 | 11.9 | 12.2 | 12.5 |
| Speed until project completion (months) | 29.66 | 30.4  | 31   | 31.8  | 32.4 | 32.9 | 33.2 | 33.6 | 32.9 | 33.9 | 34.3 | 34.4 | 34.7 | 35.3 | 35.3 | 36.1 | 36.7 | 36.7 | 36.8 | 36.8 | 36.7 | 36.6 | 36.9 | 37.4 |
|                                         |       |       |      |       |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| UNIDO                                   | 2001  | 2002  | 2003 | 2004  | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 |
| Funds disbursed                         | 48%   | 89%   | 100% | 100%  | 90%  | 80%  | 89%  | 69%  | 100% | 84%  | 95%  | 100% | 62%  | 82%  | 82%  | 75%  | 100% | 100% | 95%  | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| Speed until first disbursement (months) | 9.15  | 9.85  | 9.4  | 9.34  | 8.9  | 9.8  | 10.2 | 10.6 | 10.4 | 10.4 | 10.3 | 10.3 | 10.2 | 10.1 | 10.0 | 10.1 | 10.4 | 10.3 | 10.0 | 9.8  | 9.8  | 9.7  | 9.6  | 9.5  |
| Speed until project completion (months) | 33.66 | 33.84 | 33.7 | 33.89 | 31.9 | 33.1 | 33.0 | 32.9 | 32.0 | 31.9 | 31.4 | 32.8 | 32.8 | 33.7 | 32.7 | 33.4 | 33.5 | 32.7 | 33.0 | 34.1 | 34.1 | 33.9 | 34.3 | 34.4 |
|                                         |       |       |      |       |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| World Bank                              | 2001  | 2002  | 2003 | 2004  | 2005 | 2006 | 2007 | 2008 | 2009 | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 | 2019 | 2020 | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 |
| Funds disbursed                         | 12%   | 38%   | 100% | 79%   | 100% | 57%  | 59%  | 59%  | 19%  | 47%  | 75%  | 59%  | 49%  | 42%  | 100% | 88%  | 100% | 100% | 78%  | 33%  | 34%  | 35%  | 100% | 53%  |
| Speed until first disbursement (months) | 11.95 | 12.05 | 13.7 | 14.58 | 13.6 | 14.6 | 14.3 | 14.4 | 14.4 | 14.9 | 14.6 | 15.1 | 14.7 | 14.0 | 14.1 | 14.8 | 16.8 | 16.8 | 16.6 | 16.9 | 17.0 | 17.0 | 17.0 | 17.0 |
| Speed until project completion (months) | 29.24 | 28.85 | 30   | 30.39 | 31   | 31.5 | 31.1 | 30.7 | 30.7 | 30.3 | 30.1 | 30.3 | 30.2 | 30.0 | 29.8 | 29.8 | 29.2 | 29.3 | 29.3 | 29.3 | 29.6 | 29.6 | 29.6 | 28.9 |

Annex III

QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTING AGENCIES BY THE NATIONAL OZONE UNITS FOR 2024

| Category                     | Sub-category | Questions                                                                                                                                                   | Values              | Australia | France | Germany | UNDP | UNEP | UNIDO | World Bank | Total |
|------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|--------|---------|------|------|-------|------------|-------|
| IMPACT                       | General      | Has cooperation with the implementing agency substantially contributed and added value to your work or organization in managing compliance in your country? | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 16   | 55   | 28    | 1          | 109   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 10   | 17   | 12    | 2          | 42    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 2     |            | 3     |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                              |              | IMPACT (Overall Rating)                                                                                                                                     | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 13   | 46   | 23    | 1          | 91    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 11   | 13   | 9     | 2          | 37    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 3     |            | 4     |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                              |              | In the design and implementation of the project, has the implementing agency been striving to achieve sustainable results?                                  | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 8       | 15   | 55   | 29    | 1          | 110   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        |         | 12   | 16   | 11    | 2          | 41    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 2     |            | 2     |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
| ORGANIZATION AND COOPERATION | General      | Did cooperation with the staff of the implementing agency take place in an atmosphere of mutual understanding?                                              | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 20   | 65   | 32    | 2          | 128   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 9    | 8    | 7     | 1          | 26    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 2    |      | 5     |            | 7     |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                              |              | Did the implementing agency clearly explain its work plan and division of tasks?                                                                            | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 5       | 14   | 58   | 24    | 2          | 105   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 3       | 13   | 15   | 18    | 1          | 50    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 3    |      | 2     |            | 5     |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                              |              | Did the implementing agency sufficiently control and monitor the delivery of consultant services?                                                           | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 4       | 16   | 50   | 29    | 1          | 102   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 4       | 11   | 20   | 14    | 2          | 51    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|                              |              | Did the responsible staff of the implementing agency communicate sufficiently and help to avoid misunderstanding?                                           | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 17   | 63   | 29    | 2          | 119   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 9    | 10   | 9     | 1          | 31    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 4    |      | 6     |            | 10    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                              |              | Has the use of funds been directed effectively to reach the targets and was it agreed between the national                                                  | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 18   | 63   | 30    | 2          | 121   |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 8    | 9    | 10    | 1          | 30    |
|                              |              |                                                                                                                                                             | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 2     |            | 3     |

| Category                      | Sub-category | Questions                                                                                                                                  | Values              | Australia | France | Germany | UNDP | UNEP | UNIDO | World Bank | Total |
|-------------------------------|--------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|--------|---------|------|------|-------|------------|-------|
|                               |              | ozone unit and the implementing agency?                                                                                                    | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | If there was a lead agency for a multi-agency project, did it coordinate the activities of the other implementing agencies satisfactorily? | Highly satisfactory | 1         |        |         | 11   | 31   | 16    |            | 59    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           | 1      | 2       | 5    | 15   | 11    | 1          | 35    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 2    | 1    | 1     |            | 4     |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                               |              | ORGANIZATION AND COOPERATION (Overall Rating)                                                                                              | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 5       | 14   | 36   | 15    | 1          | 73    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 11   | 8    | 9     | 1          | 31    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 3     |            | 3     |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | Was active involvement of the national ozone unit ensured in project Development?                                                          | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 8       | 18   | 54   | 33    | 2          | 117   |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        |         | 10   | 16   | 11    | 1          | 38    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | Was active involvement of the national ozone unit ensured in project Identification?                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 8       | 19   | 56   | 31    | 2          | 118   |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        |         | 9    | 14   | 13    | 1          | 37    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | Was active involvement of the national ozone unit ensured in project Implementation?                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 8       | 17   | 56   | 32    | 2          | 117   |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        |         | 9    | 13   | 11    | 1          | 34    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | Were the required services of the implementing agency delivered in time?                                                                   | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 3       | 9    | 56   | 23    | 1          | 94    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        | 5       | 17   | 16   | 16    | 2          | 56    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 3    | 1    | 5     |            | 9     |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
| TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE/TRAINING | General      | Did project partners receive sufficient technical advice and/or assistance in their decision-making on technology?                         | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 13   | 35   | 21    | 2          | 79    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 11   | 26   | 17    | 1          | 56    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    | 1    | 3     |            | 5     |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|                               |              | Did the agency give sufficient consideration to training aspects within funding limits?                                                    | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 14   | 51   | 30    | 1          | 105   |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 11   | 17   | 11    | 2          | 42    |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    | 1    | 3     |            | 5     |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|                               |              |                                                                                                                                            | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 14   | 47   | 24    | 1          | 94    |

| Category | Sub-category        | Questions                                                                                                                                                     | Values              | Australia | France | Germany | UNDP | UNEP | UNIDO | World Bank | Total |
|----------|---------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|--------|---------|------|------|-------|------------|-------|
|          |                     | Do you feel that you have received sufficient support in building capacities for the national implementation of the project (within the funding limitations)? | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 12   | 22   | 14    | 2          | 52    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 3     |            | 3     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     | Has the acquisition of services and equipment been successfully administered, contracted and its delivery monitored?                                          | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 11   | 29   | 21    | 1          | 71    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 13   | 26   | 16    | 2          | 58    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     | In case of need, was trouble-shooting by the agency quick and in direct response to your needs?                                                               | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 13   | 46   | 28    | 1          | 97    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 12   | 19   | 7     | 2          | 41    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 2     |            | 3     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 2     |            | 3     |
|          |                     | TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE/TRAINING (Overall Rating)                                                                                                                | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 13   | 37   | 19    | 1          | 78    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 11   | 15   | 12    | 2          | 41    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 2     |            | 2     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     | Was the selection and competence of consultants provided by the agency satisfactory?                                                                          | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 5       | 15   | 45   | 25    | 2          | 94    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 9    | 20   | 18    | 1          | 50    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        | 1       |      |      |       |            | 1     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          |                     | Were project partners and stakeholders encouraged by the implementing agency to participate positively in decision-making and design of activities?           | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 16   | 50   | 24    | 2          | 100   |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 9    | 18   | 16    | 1          | 46    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 2     |            | 2     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          | Investment projects | Has the agency been effective and met the expectations of stakeholders in providing technical advice, training and commissioning?                             | Highly satisfactory | 1         |        | 3       | 11   | 35   | 24    | 1          | 75    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           | 1      | 4       | 11   | 15   | 9     |            | 40    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     | Has the agency been responsive in addressing any technical difficulties that may have been encountered subsequent to the provision of non-ODS technology?     | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 4       | 10   | 25   | 19    | 1          | 61    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Satisfactory        |           |        | 3       | 12   | 17   | 10    |            | 42    |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 1     |            | 1     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                     |                                                                                                                                                               | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 6       | 12   | 33   | 20    | 1          | 74    |

| Category | Sub-category                   | Questions                                                                             | Values              | Australia | France | Germany | UNDP | UNEP | UNIDO | World Bank | Total |
|----------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------|--------|---------|------|------|-------|------------|-------|
|          | National phase-out plans       | Has support for the distribution of equipment been adequate?                          | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 10   | 13   | 14    | 1          | 40    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      | 1    |       |            | 1     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                                | Has support to identify policy issues related to implementation been adequate?        | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 4       | 9    | 45   | 24    | 1          | 85    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 9    | 22   | 12    | 2          | 47    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                                | Has technical advice on equipment specifications been adequate?                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 7       | 10   | 31   | 25    |            | 75    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 11   | 17   | 12    | 2          | 43    |
|          |                                | Has the technical advice or training that was provided been effective?                | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    | 1    |       |            | 2     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         |        | 5       | 12   | 50   | 26    | 1          | 95    |
|          |                                | Were proposed implementation strategies adequate?                                     | Satisfactory        |           | 1      | 3       | 9    | 14   | 11    | 2          | 40    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         | 1    | 1    | 2     |            | 4     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          | Regulatory assistance projects | Were the regulations that were proposed by the agency Adapted to local circumstances? | Highly satisfactory | 1         |        | 2       | 10   | 40   | 20    |            | 73    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           | 1      | 2       | 4    | 22   | 11    | 2          | 42    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|          |                                | Were the regulations that were proposed by the agency Applicable?                     | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 3       | 10   | 47   | 15    |            | 77    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 4    | 15   | 16    | 2          | 38    |
|          |                                | Were the regulations that were proposed by the agency Enforceable?                    | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 3       | 9    | 38   | 17    |            | 69    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           |        | 1       | 5    | 23   | 14    | 2          | 45    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      |       |            |       |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      |       |            | 1     |
|          | Training projects              | Was the quality of the training provided satisfactory?                                | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 5       | 14   | 48   | 27    | 2          | 98    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Satisfactory        |           |        | 2       | 3    | 14   | 8     |            | 27    |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Less satisfactory   |           |        |         |      |      | 1     |            | 1     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Unsatisfactory      |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |
|          |                                |                                                                                       | Highly satisfactory | 1         | 1      | 5       | 14   | 42   | 25    | 1          | 89    |

| Category | Sub-category | Questions                                                                                 | Values            | Australia | France | Germany | UNDP | UNEP | UNIDO | World Bank | Total |
|----------|--------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|-----------|--------|---------|------|------|-------|------------|-------|
|          |              | Was the training designed so that those trained would be likely to use the skills taught? | Satisfactory      |           |        | 2       | 3    | 20   | 10    | 1          | 36    |
|          |              |                                                                                           | Less satisfactory |           |        |         |      |      | 1     |            | 1     |
|          |              |                                                                                           | Unsatisfactory    |           |        |         | 1    |      | 1     |            | 2     |